

Bethel University

Spark

All Electronic Theses and Dissertations

2015

The New Reformed Pastor: Zwinglian Wisdom for Modern Ministers

Scotty Jermaine Williams
Bethel University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://spark.bethel.edu/etd>



Part of the [Christianity Commons](#), and the [Religious Thought, Theology and Philosophy of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Williams, S. J. (2015). *The New Reformed Pastor: Zwinglian Wisdom for Modern Ministers* [Doctoral thesis, Bethel University]. Spark Repository. <https://spark.bethel.edu/etd/662>

This Doctoral thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Spark. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Electronic Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Spark.

BETHEL UNIVERSITY
BETHEL SEMINARY

THE NEW REFORMED PASTOR:
ZWINGLIAN WISDOM FOR MODERN MINISTERS

A THESIS PROJECT IN PARTIAL FULLFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENT
FOR THE DOCTOR OF MINISTRY DEGREE
IN CHURCH LEADERSHIP

BY
SCOTTY J. WILLIAMS
ST. PAUL, MINNESOTA
MAY 2015

ABSTRACT

Throughout churches in the Reformed tradition, there is a growing interest in renewing Eucharistic practices. This growing interest has led to a series of discussions among Reformed clergy regarding the role of pastors in the Eucharistic context. According to some church leaders, many Reformed pastors have a faulty sacramentality that stems from a misunderstanding of John Calvin's pastoral vision. Instead of compelling faith in action through the Eucharist, where communicants share the grace they receive, this sacramentality leads them to be passive recipients that keep Eucharistic grace within the church.

Unlike other research, which addresses the aforementioned issue by only clarifying Calvin's pastoral vision, this project makes use of the vision and sacramentality of Ulrich Zwingli. Through a review of literature and interviews, this project shows that the Reformed tradition's dominant Calvinistic template of pastoral ministry does not promote the sharing of eucharistic grace. Therefore, in addressing the pastoral sacramental issue of this project, the research presents the formulation and implementation of a Zwinglian pastoral template. In Zwingli's pastoral vision, Eucharistic grace is not restricted to the Church, and the aim of pastoral ministry is enabling parishioners to put faith into action.

In presenting a Zwinglian template called the "Healing Shepherd," this project does not discard the Calvinistic template. Rather, this project seeks to bring balance

between the pastoral visions of Zwingli and Calvin by presenting one template as incomplete without and complementing the other. The end result of both templates working together is a “New Reformed pastor,” who compels communicants to be agents of healing by sharing Eucharistic grace with the world. The result is a “Healing Shepherd” who fosters faith in action through the Lord’s Table.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I thank Almighty God for the many blessings I have experienced while going about this great project. Were it not for His love and faithfulness, I would not have made it this far in my pastoral calling and academic pursuits. But most importantly, were it not for his marvelous grace I would not have made it this far in life from my humble beginnings in the poverty of rural Louisiana. According to many statistics I should not be where I am today, but God saw otherwise. In the end, all the credit for what I have become and achieved is ultimately due to the Lord, who is ever faithful, ever loving and ever gracious!

Many thanks to my loving mother Vanessa and late grandparents Frank Calvin and Eva-Marie, who sacrificed much that I might receive an education. Were it not for their prayers, faith, love, discipline and noble example, I would not have become the man I am today. My heartfelt gratitude also goes to my amazing brothers Leonard, KarDaniel and Noah whose encouragement and jesting have been a constant joy and strength to me. I also owe a special gratitude to my wonderful Louisiana-Creole people whose great resilience in the face of diverse troubles has given me resilience.

I am deeply grateful to my professor of nine years and doctoral advisor Timothy Senapatiratne, who has been a constant mentor and guide. I am also grateful to Jürg Kessler, David Stenner, Jessica Lu, Janet Eberli, Ruedi Basler, Willem Balke, Peter Opitz, Richard Davis and Desiree Dippenaar for helping me to understand and appreciate

Ulrich Zwingli's thought and articulate it so that others might better understand him.

Many thanks to Brien Aadland, my closest colleague and brother in ministry, who has held me accountable in various undertakings. And last but not least, I must express my deepest gratitude to my "bijou et jolie catin" (jewel and pretty doll); my wife Maria.

Without her love, support, encouragement and patience I would not have been able to muster the strength to press on in research. Also without her help in proofreading and honest critiques, I would not have been able to make my thoughts understood more clearly. Maria has given me much inspiration and motivation in writing. Words cannot express how much I am indebted to her.

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

DEDICATION

CHAPTER ONE: PROBLEM AND RESEARCH DESIGN	1
Introduction	1
Definitions	2
Delimitations	5
Assumptions	5
Subproblems	6
Setting of the Project	7
Importance of the Project	9
Importance of the Project to the Researcher	9
Importance of the Project to the Immediate Context of Ministry	9
Importance of the Project to the Church at Large	10
CHAPTER TWO: FAITH IN ACTION ACCORDING TO ZWINGLI	11
Christ Our Captain: The Ultimate Example of Faith in Action	11
The Church and the Ultimate Example	14
The Pastor and the Ultimate Example	21
Conclusion: A Summary of Zwingli's Views of Faith in Action	29
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW	31
Third Man of the Reformation	31
The Place of Zwingli and Calvin within the Reformed Tradition	34
Liberal Zwinglianism, Conservative Calvinism	36
Zwingli's Influence on Calvin	40
Contexts: Local Zwingli, Foreign Calvin	42
Pastoral Visions	47
Zwingli's Pastoral Vision	48
Calvin's Pastoral Vision	52
Two Visions Made One: Zwingli and Calvin Together	56
Conclusion: A Case for Zwingli	58
CHAPTER FOUR: PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND RESEARCH METHODS	61
Research Methodologies	61

Participants and Data Collection.....	63
A Case for Using LET	65
Interview Data Analysis.....	68
CHAPTER FIVE: RESEARCH AND DATA ANALYSISPROJECT DESCRIPTION AND RESEARCH METHODS.....	70
Stages of Critique: Theologians, Pastors and Ordinands.....	70
Stage One: Willem Balke.....	72
Balke Interview	72
Stage Two: Peter Opitz	76
Opitz Interview	76
Stage Three: Richard Davis	81
Davis Interview	82
Stage Four: Desiree Dippenaar	86
Dippenaar Interview.....	86
Conclusion	91
CHAPTER SIX: EVALUATION AND CONCLUSIONS	93
A New Template.....	93
Understanding Zwingli's Perspective of Faith in Action	94
Significance of Zwingli's Perspective	95
Understanding Zwingli's Pastoral Vision.....	97
Significance of Zwingli's Pastoral Vision	98
Understanding Zwingli's Sacramentality	100
Significance of Zwingli's Sacramentality.....	101
The Healing Shepherd Template	103
Testing the New Template.....	104
Strengths of the New Template.....	107
Weaknesses of the New Template	109
CHAPTER SEVEN: REFLECTION	112
Personal Insights	112
Suggestions for Future Researchers.....	115
Future Use of Current Research.....	117
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	118

To my loving grandparents Frank Calvin and Eva-Marie Williams.

+Repose en paix, Pawpaw et Mawmaw; mo lemme vous.+

CHAPTER ONE

PROBLEM AND RESEARCH DESIGN

Introduction

The problem this project sought to address was a pastoral/sacramental issue among Reformed Churches regarding the Eucharist and faith in action. According to groups such as the Federal Vision Movement [FVM], an improper understanding of John Calvin's original pastoral vision has resulted in a faulty sacramentality that makes Reformed pastors less effective in encouraging faith in action through the Eucharist.¹ Rather than compelling believers to be active givers, sharing the grace they receive through the Eucharist, this sacramentality leads them to be passive recipients of grace. In response to this problem, the researcher sought to address the ineffectiveness of the Reformed pastorate due to the aforementioned issue by (a) correctly understanding Calvin's pastoral vision and sacramental views, (b) making use of the vision and views of Ulrich Zwingli, the founder of the Reformed tradition, and (c) exploring Zwingli's philosophy of ministry through Leadership Emergence Theory (LET) which focuses on the dynamics that shape one's development as a leader and views of ministry. By making use of and exploring Zwingli's vision, sacramentality and philosophy, the researcher

¹ E. Calvin Beisner, *The Auburn Avenue Theology, Pros and Cons: Debating the Federal Vision*, 59-66.

worked to create a new template for Reformed pastoral ministry. This new template was designed to complement the Reformed tradition's dominant Calvinistic template and aid Reformed pastors in helping parishioners to share the grace of the Eucharist through faith in action.

Definitions

Calvinism - A system of theological beliefs and church practices based on the ideas of the French theologian John Calvin (1509-1564).

Covenant Theology - A conceptual overview and interpretive framework for understanding the overall flow of the Bible. It uses the theological concept of covenant as an organizing principle for Christian theology. In Covenant Theology, the Gospel is set in the context of God's eternal plan of communion with his people, and its historical outworking in the covenants of works and grace (as well as in the various progressive stages of the covenant of grace).

Federal Vision Movement (FVM, also called "Auburn Avenue Theology") - A Reformed theological conversation that began in 2002 at Auburn Avenue Presbyterian Church in Monroe, Louisiana. The Federal Vision Movement seeks to restate traditional Reformed theology in order to apply a more robust Covenant theology in regard to the relationship between obedience and faith, and the role of the Church and Sacraments in one's salvation. Proponents are made up of a loosely organized but vocal group of writers among confessional Reformed and Presbyterian churches in the United States who appear

intent on revising core confessional doctrines such as election, covenant, the sacraments, and justification.

Individualism - A doctrine which states that the interests of the individual are or ought to be ethically paramount; in other words, the rights of the individual are more important than the rights of the community. Individualism can also be defined as the idea that all values, rights, and duties originate in individuals rather than communities.

Leadership Emergence Theory - Leadership emergence theory (LET) is a descriptive theory of how Christian leaders develop over a lifetime. It was articulated by J. Robert Clinton in a study which analyzed the lives of 420 historical and contemporary Christian leaders and missionaries. Clinton pointed out that his research had two goals. The first goal was to “determine a method for organizing and categorizing qualitative life-history data so that it could form an ongoing useful database for analysis.”² Clinton’s second goal was to “integrate the findings so as to form the basis for a theory of Christian leadership development.”³

Pastoral Template - A transferable pattern of ministry that is based on the pastoral vision and philosophy of ministry that emerges from the life experiences and work of a specific pastors or pastors.

² Stadler, Anita G. “Leadership Emergence Theory in the Corporate Context.” *International Journal of Leadership Studies*, no. 5 (2009).
http://www.regent.edu/acad/global/publications/ijls/new/vol5iss1/IJLS_Vol5Is1_StadlerR.pdf (June 1, 2012).

³ Stadler, “Leadership Emergence Theory in the Corporate Context.”

Pastoral Theology - A branch of theology that deals with the responsibilities of those in clerical and ministerial positions and those who receive spiritual guidance and counseling from them.

Pastoral Vision - The core theme behind and central aim of a pastor's ministry. This vision is the essence of a pastor's ministry, and helps one to understand how a pastor views him or herself and the emphases they have.

Reformed - Referring to a tradition of Protestantism that was founded by the Swiss-German pastor and theologian Ulrich Zwingli, and later developed by those such as Martin Bucer, Heinrich Bullinger and John Calvin; it is also influenced by ideas from Martin Luther. Though Calvinism is the most dominant and well-known perspective of Reformed theology (and is often called "the Reformed tradition"), it is only part of the Reformed tradition and its theology as a whole. In truth, the Reformed tradition is both Calvinistic and Zwinglian.

Sacrament - A religious ceremony or act of the Christian Church instituted by Christ Himself that is regarded as an outward and visible sign of divine grace. The Roman Catholic and Eastern traditions believe that there are seven sacraments (baptism, confirmation, holy communion, confession, anointing of the sick, ordination, and marriage), while most Churches within the Protestant tradition believe there are only two (baptism and holy communion).

Sacramentality - Of, pertaining to or of the nature of a sacrament, especially the sacrament of the Eucharist.

Zwinglianism - The theological beliefs and Church practices first promoted by the Swiss-German theologian Ulrich Zwingli (1484-1531), who led the Swiss Protestant Reformation in Zürich Switzerland and founded the Reformed tradition.

Delimitations

The researcher presented the Reformed tradition from a broad perspective denominationally, but limited the research for confessionally Reformed bodies that require ministers to hold Calvinistic beliefs (e.g., Presbyterian Church in America, Orthodox Presbyterian Church, and United Reformed Churches of North America.). It was not for Reformed bodies that simply have roots in the Reformed tradition, but do not require ministers to hold Calvinistic beliefs (e.g., the United Church of Christ, National Association of Congregational Christian Churches, the Conservative Congregational Christian Conference, etc.).

This research was be limited to addressing the pastoral theology of the Reformed tradition and specific pastoral concerns rather than Reformed theology as a whole.

Assumptions

The first assumption is that it is better to form templates of pastoral ministry from both the life story and theological perspectives of Christian leaders rather than their theological perspectives alone.

The second assumption is that many Reformed denominations and leaders default to Calvinistic theology because Calvin was the Reformed tradition's greatest contributor; the result is that the insights of other founders of the Reformed tradition (e.g., Ulrich

Zwingli, Johannes Oecolampadius, Heinrich Bullinger, Martin Bucer and Leo Juda) are unintentionally left out when these denominations proceed with theological dialogue.

Subproblems

This first sub-problem was to understand the root cause(s) of the pastoral and sacramental concerns, pointed out by those such as the FVM, that have negatively affected the Reformed pastorate.

The second sub-problem was to address the issues behind the root cause(s) of the pastoral and sacramental concerns that have negatively affected the Reformed pastorate.

The third sub-problem was to discover effective ways of laying out Zwingli's pastoral theology in light of him leaving no major literary work (or magnum opus) like Calvin's *Institutes* that expressed it in a complete organized system.

The fourth sub-problem was to determine if the biographical data being collected through various means of contemporary field research, such as interviews and books, could help to form an adequate picture of Zwingli's pastoral vision, philosophy of ministry and sacramentality that could serve as a template for pastoral theology.

The fifth sub-problem was to develop and present a new Reformed template of pastoral ministry that is based upon the life, legacy, and theology of Ulrich Zwingli.

Setting of the Project

The setting for this project was the International Protestant Church of Zürich (IPC Zürich) where the researcher currently serves as Associate Pastor. Despite its quest to be interdenominational, IPC Zürich is a Zwinglian Reformed Church that seeks to address the same issue as the researcher. In addition, IPC Zürich seeks to have an effective pastorate that meets the pastoral concerns within its context, and in recent years one pastoral concern has been the false assumption that, as long as a congregation promotes certain evangelical distinctives or “trademarks” (e.g., Biblicism, missions and evangelism), then they need not worry about anything else. For example, to avoid being like the State Church (Landeskirche), where the Bible is less central to Church life and ministry, many evangelical Swiss Free Churches (e.g. the Schweizerische Pfingstmission and Chrischona Gemeinde) assume that all parishioners need for sufficient pastoral care are empowering Bible-based sermons.⁴ But sadly, this assumption has led to concerns over a decrease in local congregational outreach, which Jason Mandryk mentions in, “*Operation World: The Definitive Prayer Guide to Every Nation*.” Mandryk writes:

Stagnation and decline have sapped the Church....Pray that congregational outreach may increase through personal evangelism, home Bible studies and cell/house Church planting. Pray that true believers in the State and Free Churches may be more effectively motivated and activated for outreach.⁵

In the end, the assumption regarding pastoral care and empowering sermons has added to a series of issues that have brought about a decrease in congregational in-reach and, subsequently, congregational outreach in many Swiss Churches (including IPC

⁴ Rüdiger, Phillip, Interview with Scotty Williams. Gränichen (Chrischona Gemeinde). April 13, 2012.

⁵ Jason Mandryk, *Operation World: The Definitive Prayer Guide to Every Nation*, 800

Zürich). But apart from this decrease, the assumption regarding pastoral care has also led many parishioners to define successful pastoral ministry as solely giving good sermons. Nevertheless, due to its Zwinglian foundation, IPC Zürich defines pastoral ministry as leading parishioners through various means (e.g. preaching and pastoral care) that compel them to live out the Word of God and put their faith into action.⁶ This “Zwinglian” definition has led the congregation’s Council of Elders to wonder how the Church could better promote its Zwinglian foundation.

One means by which IPC’s Council of Elders has thought of better promoting its Zwinglian foundation is through its pastorate. There are also numerous Zwinglian scholars attending the Church who could help the researcher in conducting proper studies of Zwingli's life and theology. Therefore, IPC Zürich was a very suitable setting for this project, and apart from its scholar-members and historical Zwinglian foundation, the Church’s local context added to its suitability. After all, Zürich is the same city where Zwingli performed his reforming work over 500 years ago. But in the present era, the tradition he founded is in need of fresh expressions so that the world might better see faith in action among God’s people in Reformed communities.

⁶ Gottfried Wilhelm Locher, *Zwingli's Thought: New Perspectives*, 28. In this book Locher presents a prayer by Zwingli that the leadership of IPC Zürich believes to fully encapsulate its Zwinglian foundation. The prayer says, “*Almighty, eternal and merciful God, whose Word is a lamp unto our feet and a light unto our path, open and illuminate our minds, that we may purely and perfectly understand your Word and that our lives may be conformed to what we have rightly understood, that in nothing we may be displeasing to your majesty, through Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.*”

Importance of the Project

Importance of the Project to the Researcher

This project is important to the researcher because it deals with helping pastors to better avoid the pitfalls of only seeking doctrinal orthodoxy (e.g., overlooking the importance of orthopraxy). In addition, being a Reformed minister, the researcher has been impacted by the Zwinglian tradition and its emphasis on the Word of God being rightly preached and rightly lived out. As a result of being impacted by this emphasis on God's Word, the researcher has been drawn to more practical rather than theoretical theologies which, despite their beauty, often remain in academic circles or on the shelves of libraries. This project is also important to the researcher because it presents an alternative approach to addressing controversies and crises within the Reformed world, besides offering revisions of Calvinism. Instead, this project presents an approach to addressing Reformed controversies and crises by introducing a non-Calvinistic Reformed perspective (Zwinglianism) into the discourse that embraces philosophy and theories while at the same time striving to make them realized in practical ways. Sadly, many Reformed leaders encourage believers to only strive for correct doctrine, and this causes people to reject the Reformed faith due to lack of encouragement to also strive for correct living.

Importance of the Project to the Immediate Context of Ministry

This project is important to the researcher's immediate context of ministry (IPC Zürich) because it is a Reformed congregation aware of the pastoral and sacramental

concerns expressed by those such as the FVM. In the case of the FVM, many within the IPC Zürich community would agree with its goal of delineating practical elements to implement into Church life. Nevertheless, as many critics of the FVM have rightly pointed out, some of its proposed elements (e.g., paedocommunion) are not compatible with the historic Reformed faith which IPC Zürich seeks to uphold. Many IPC Zürich parishioners are from a Swiss-German Reformed background, and wonder what the Zwinglian tradition could contribute to the Reformed world in the modern context.

Importance of the Project to the Church at Large

This project is important to the Church at large because it addresses sacramental and pastoral issues that are dividing certain Reformed bodies and in turn, adding more division to the Church universal. In truth, part of the researcher's heart behind this project is to produce a pastoral template that brings balance and ultimately promotes Christian unity. This project attempts to give Zwingli a more active role in modern Reformed Church life so that believers might be better able to put their faith into action through living out their lives in accordance to the Word of God. Though Zwingli founded the Reformed tradition, he is often called the “forgotten man of the Reformation“. Nevertheless, this project will attempt to bring him back into memory and make Reformed believers aware of the vital role he plays within the discourse of Reformed pastoral ministry and Church life.

CHAPTER TWO: FAITH IN ACTION ACCORDING TO ZWINGLI

Since the foundation of this project is the Zwinglian belief that pastoral ministry is leading parishioners in putting their faith into action, it is necessary to lay out Zwingli's biblical and theological perspective regarding this subject. The ultimate example of faith in action for Zwingli is Christ Himself, and the Church community puts faith into action by individually and collectively imitating Him. To lay out Zwingli's views in detail, the researcher will focus on faith in action in Jesus Christ and what it means for the Church and the role of pastors. This chapter will explore how Christ is the ultimate example of faith in action, and how the church and pastors follow His example.

Christ Our Captain: The Ultimate Example of Faith in Action

In order to understand Zwingli's view of faith in action and Christ as the ultimate example, one must look to the main emphasis of his theology, which is a strict adherence to the Bible. In fact, as Kenneth Curtis of the *Christian History Institute* points out, the Bible was so central to Zwingli's theological development that he hand-copied the epistles of Paul in Greek and memorized most of them.¹ Zwingli adhered strictly to the Bible because he believed it was the Word of God and that only God was truth; without the aid of the Bible, human reason only led to falsehoods about the divine.² He also believed that the Bible was clear and plain, and that a true understanding of the Word of

¹ Kenneth Curtis. *Reformation Overview* (video). Documentary, Christian History Institute, Worcester, Pennsylvania, Accessed July 17, 2012. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BSmYchmMCOc>

² G.W. Bromiley, *Zwingli and Bullinger* 87

God was available to every person (from noble to commoner) whose spirit was enlightened by the Holy Spirit.³ In his sermon, “*On the Clarity and Certainty of the Word of God*,” he writes:

When the Word of God shines on human understanding, the mind is enlightened to such an extent that it understands and confesses the Word and becomes certain of it. That was the experience of David who proclaimed: “The unfolding of your Words gives light; it imparts understanding to the simple” (Psalm 119:130). Simple ones are those who can do nothing for themselves but resemble the child whom Jesus set in the midst of the disciples to teach them humility, saying: “Truly I tell you, except you change and become like children, you will never enter the Kingdom of Heaven” (Matthew 18:3).⁴

Since Zwingli believed that the Bible was plain and clear, then those enlightened by the Holy Spirit (no matter how simple they were) would look to the book of Hebrews (which he held in high esteem) and clearly see the definition of faith in 11:1.⁵ According to the author of Hebrews, faith is a “confidence in what is hoped for and an assurance in what is not seen.”⁶ In his interpretation of Hebrews 11:1, Zwingli defines faith as “the sign of election” by God for those who are ordained for eternal life.⁷ The Reformer believed that God gave a certainty of the soul that allowed them to apprehend Him as being itself.⁸ Upon realizing they were chosen through an awareness of their faith, the believer would then do good works with an inner spiritual assurance.⁹ In other words,

³ Scott H. Hendrix, *Early Protestant Spirituality*, 43

⁴ Bromiley, 75

⁵ Gottfried Wilhelm Locher, *Zwingli's Thought: New Perspectives*, 245

⁶ Unless otherwise noted, all Scripture citations are from *The Holy Bible, English Standard Version*, (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Bibles, 2001)

⁷ Susan E. Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise?*, 64

⁸ Paul R. Hinlicky, *Luther and the Beloved Community*, 166

⁹ G.R. Potter, *Zwingli*, 196

awareness of faith leads to faith in action, not simply belief, and the good works of faith in action are signs that one is truly a Christian filled with the Holy Spirit.

But apart from signs, Zwingli saw the good works of faith in action as identifying with Christ or “putting on the new being,” and he found this concept in Ephesians 4:22, 24. As he reflected on these verses, he once wrote, “Just as Christ also, having risen from the dead dies no more, so also they, having laid aside the old being, should put on a new being [Eph. 4:22, 24] which is like God, that is, the Lord Jesus Christ. Putting on this new being is nothing other than living as he lived.”¹⁰

For Zwingli, putting on the new being was the imitation of Christ, and he likens this imitation to soldiers responding to their Captain. In his *Third Essay Against Johan Faber*, he urges persecuted Protestants to “let all the children of this world boast and make a noise and threaten, for they are unable and unwilling to do anything else; and let everyone look to his Captain, Jesus Christ (Hebrews 12), who will not lead us astray.”¹¹

Upon reading Hebrews 12:2-3, Zwingli believed that the Christian would also see “Christ their Captain,” whom the writer calls “the pioneer and perfecter of faith” who “for the joy set before Him endured the cross, scorning its shame, and sat down at the right hand of the throne of God.” But in addition to Christ, the Christian would also see a cloud of witnesses or saints long gone who imitated Christ by putting on the new self. Though the cloud of witnesses are all Old Testament figures, Zwingli believed that they were “pre-Christian Christians” saved by faith in Christ just as those after Christ are

¹⁰ Fritz Büsser, “The Shepherd – Who is the True Pastor?,” *Christian History*, no. 3 (Winter 1984). <http://www.christianitytoday.com/ch/1984/issue4/416.html?start=1> (accessed June 3, 2014)

¹¹ Locher, 72

saved by faith in Him.¹² Furthermore, along with Old Testament figures, the Reformer believed that certain pagan Greek philosophers were also pre-Christian Christians, and in his *Commentary on True and False Religion*, he mentions names such as Heracles and Seneca.¹³

In the end, Zwingli saw both the Old and New Testaments presenting Jesus as the ultimate example of faith in action, and because of this he saw the imitation of Christ as the ultimate sign of election.¹⁴ What the Reformer seems to imply in his essay to Faber is that if one is chosen by God for eternal life, then they will ultimately live as Jesus Christ (His chosen One) lived on earth. But apart from being a sign of election, the imitation of Christ also gives life to one's faith, for as He tells His disciples in John 14:6, He is "the way and the truth and the life," and has come that God's people might have "life and have it more abundantly."

The Church and the Ultimate Example

Since the imitation of Christ is the ultimate sign of election in Zwingli's theology, then the Church (God's elect community) would naturally imitate His example of faith in action. In regards to his views on the imitation of Christ, the Zürich Reformer was far from an "innovator," and like his colleagues and contemporaries resisted being referred to as such.¹⁵ As Wilhelm Locher writes, Zwingli was heavily influenced by and

¹² Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *An Introduction to the History of Religions*, 86

¹³ Karl Barth, *The Theology of John Calvin*, 100

¹⁴ Locher, 245

¹⁵ Scott M. Manetsh, "Is the Reformation Over? John Calvin, Roman Catholicism, and Contemporary Ecumenical Conversations," *Themelios* no.2 (Fall 2011). (accessed January 5, 2014)

personally knew Desiderius Erasmus, who taught that Christ initiated the process of development and imitating Him was humanity's corresponding work.¹⁶ Locher also writes that Erasmus received his views from the Brethren of Common Life, who based their practices of piety on the teachings of St. Thomas à Kempis, whose most famous work is titled *The Imitation of Christ*.¹⁷

Due to Zwingli obtaining his views from Erasmus and others, it could be argued that formulating a Zwinglian template of pastoral ministry is unnecessary; after all, it would only be a rehashing of known ideas that numerous Christians have put into practice since the 1500's. Nevertheless, what makes Zwingli stand out is the innovative ways in which he implemented the views he received regarding the imitation of Christ in the Church community.

For humanists like Erasmus, who looked at reform from an educational standpoint, spiritual concepts such as following the example of Jesus could be put into a comprehensive system that social and ecclesiastical authorities could agree upon.¹⁸ After agreeing upon this comprehensive system, authorities would then implement it among the common people of Europe and gradually bring about reform and renewal within the Church and society. In truth, the Erasmian plan of reform was more of an individualistic approach with change coming through a hierarchy of clergy, scholars and educated laity, but for Zwingli such a plan was insufficient. Locher writes:

¹⁶ Locher, 245

¹⁷ Locher, 245

¹⁸ Victor George, *Major Thinkers in Welfare: Contemporary Issues in Historical Perspective*, 62

Zwingli was a reformer – and a humanist. He opposed with holy wrath the endeavor to adapt the Christian life of faith and obedience to a comprehensive human system. The personal Lordship of Jesus Christ would thereby be impugned and the freedom of God's Word denied.¹⁹

The literature seems to imply that what made Zwingli dislike the Erasmian plan of reform is that, despite its goal to fix the ills of the Church through education, it sought to do so by using the same broken systems that brought about the need for reform in the first place. To be fair, Erasmus did mock and criticize the Church leaders of his day in his famous Latin essay *The Praise of Folly*, but placing the task of reform in the context of a hierarchy would only continue to keep the laity under the control of the clergy and other authorities.²⁰ If the Erasmian plan were carried out to its full conclusion, then common Christians would be left without full access to the Bible, unable to go about understanding its meaning for themselves and ultimately unable to put their faith into action as a community. In other words, the Erasmian plan could replace the personal Lordship of Christ and freedom of God's Word with the lordship of key thinking authorities, possibly developing an unhealthy dependence upon them. But in addition to these concerns, it would also overemphasize the power of education and overlook its limitations.

In his strong call for reform through education, Erasmus focused too much on positive aspects of his arguments. According to Victor George, the humanist overlooked the antitheses of his arguments and failed to see that education does more than enlighten a society.²¹ Education also reflects a society and, like various institutions that it can

¹⁹ George, 62

²⁰ Desiderius Erasmus, *The Praise of Folly*, 7

²¹ George, 63

reform (e.g., churches, government, etc.), it too occasionally needs reform. Erasmus also overlooked the fact that, despite being correct, educational proposals that go against the dominant thought of an era can be ill received and quickly rejected.

In response to the pitfalls of an individualistic and hierarchical Erasmian plan, Zwingli does not (like certain Anabaptist groups) call for a plan that is completely communal and does away with education or the guidance of authorities. Instead, as Locher points out, he acknowledges the need for a healthy degree of individualism and education by authorities balanced by a need for a healthy degree of community and freedom of parishioners in seeking to understand the Bible for themselves.

Zwingli's historical achievement is twofold. First he set aside the individualism of the Erasmian humanist ideal the concept of community life as a basic and irreducible element in the realization of *humanitas* (human nature, civilization, and kindness). Pangs of conscience over social responsibility were a major motif of his Reformation. Moreover he never abandoned the educational goal and task in his reformation protest. On the contrary, he postulated the integration of education into the Christian life.²²

One example of Zwingli's views of education and its role within the Christian life can be found in his 1523 Latin treatise, *On the Education of the Youth*. What is interesting to note is that at the beginning of this treatise, he acknowledges the limits of education in regard to faith, and encourages youth under the guidance of teachers to independently look to Christ as the "perfect exemplar of all virtues" (or ultimate example of faith in action).

First and chiefly, it is beyond our human capacity to bring the hearts of men to faith in the one God even though we had an eloquence surpassing that of Pericles. For that is something which only our heavenly Father can do as He draws us to Himself.²³

²² Locher, 254

²³ Bromiley, 104

Zwingli goes on to say that if the student does come to faith then he/she will find all the patterns of right conduct in Christ Himself, the perfect exemplar of all virtues. If the student knows Christ fully both in word and deed, he/she will also know that in all acts and counsels, in so far as human frailty allows, one must strive to live out part of the Christian virtues.²⁴ Upon receiving faith, students will find themselves compelled to put it into action by the practice of virtue.

For Zwingli reform was not possible with only educational programs by learned authorities or the simple interpretations of Scripture by humble commoners. Reformation was only possible with authorities and common Christians working together in a relationship modeled after Christ's pastoral image of a good shepherd and his flock in John 10:11.²⁵ In this relationship, authorities followed the example of Christ, the Good Shepherd, by gently guiding common Christians as they freely sought to understand the Bible. G.R. Evans states that Zwingli illustrates this gentle guidance in his sermon, *The Shepherd*.

Zwingli wrote to defend the concept of a paid, educated ministry, sure in his conviction that laborers were worth the hire. He tells the story of an Anabaptist weaver who announced that he would preach in his parish church on Sunday. The minister, to avoid disturbance let him do so. He began to read from 1 Timothy, but when he came to the phrase "whose consciences are branded" in 4:2, he stopped and said "I do not understand this." Whereupon the minister retorted, "Stop then and I shall expound it for you."²⁶

Through his story of the weaver, Zwingli showed that authorities must gently guide common Christians so that they might freely go about understanding the Bible,

²⁴ Bromiley, 109

²⁵ Büsser, "The Shepherd – Who Is the True Pastor?"

²⁶ G.R. Evans, *The History of Pastoral Care*, 235

and, furthermore, take leadership within the Church community and proclaim the Gospel. In other words, through following the example of Jesus, authorities were to go about transformational leadership, where leaders nurture those under their authority to become leaders. Authorities were shepherds teaching the flock of common Christians how to shepherd others in imitating Christ. Evidence of this “shepherding flock” concept can be found in the words in Johann Füsslin’s rebuke of the Zürich Reformation’s opponents. After hearing their threats, he replied, “When Christ, the Son of God, had been put to death, fishermen rose up to fill His place. And now, if you destroy the preachers of the Truth, you will see glaziers, millers, potters, founders, shoemakers and tailors teaching in their stead.”²⁷

By teaching common Christians to shepherd others, authorities brought the laity into a leadership role in the process of educating people to follow the example of Jesus. Yet, apart from this, common Christians were also joining authorities in imitating Christ through good works. In truth, teaching is one of many good works that Christ did as He walked the earth, and Zwingli believed that when people did good works, they were following the example of Jesus and giving the only appropriate response to God’s work in electing them, which is joyful obedience to Him through good works.²⁸ But apart from a response, Zwingli also saw obedience through good works as a result of faith which comes solely through God’s grace at work in the human heart. In other words, the defining result of faith through the grace of God is faith put into action through good works. Zwingli writes:

²⁷ William M. Blackwell, *Ulrich Zwingli: The Patriotic Reformer*, 82

²⁸ Bromiley, 53

For God is an entelechy, that is, a perfect and immutable force which moves all things and itself remains unmoved. And as such, He will never allow the heart which He has drawn to Himself to be unmoved or static. This statement has to be confirmed, not by proofs but by practice. For only believers know and experience the fact that Christ will not let His people be idle. ...Therefore those who have rightly understood the mystery of the Gospel will exert themselves to live rightly.²⁹

So according to Zwingli, the result of faith through God's grace is that it is put into action through good works of obedience to Him. And when those in Christ individually and collectively put their faith into action in this way, the end result is the reform of both Church and society.³⁰

In the end, unlike the Erasmian plan, Zwingli's plan of reform avoided the danger of the lordship of learned authorities, upon which common Christians could have an unhealthy dependence, replacing the personal Lordship of Christ and freedom of God's Word. It also brought a healthier balance between the individual and communal elements of religious life, and compelled authorities and common Christians to live out the words of Ephesians 4:11-16, where the Apostle Paul tells believers to use their different gifts and callings to build up the Church to unity and maturity. But above all, Zwingli's plan of reform compelled everyone within the Church to follow Christ's command in Matthew 22:39 and love one another as neighbors with the same goal of putting their faith into action through good works which changed Church and society.

²⁹ Bromiley, 107-108

³⁰ Lee P. Wandel, "Brothers and Neighbors: The Language of Community in Zwingli's Preaching," *Zwingliana*, 17, no. 5 (January 1988) 361-374

Nevertheless, Zwingli knew that like any plan of reform, his plan could become distorted, and to thwart any possible distortion he called the Church community to do good works motivated solely by love for Jesus as they followed His example. He once preached that:

Works done outside of Jesus Christ are worthless. Since everything is done of Him, in Him, and by Him, what can we lay claim to for ourselves? Wherever there is faith in God, there God is; and where God abides, there a zeal exists urging and impelling men to do good works. Take care only that Christ is in you, and that you are in Christ, and doubt not that then He is at work within you. The life of a Christian is one perpetual good work which God begins, continues and completes.³¹

The Pastor and the Ultimate Example

Though true Christians show the ultimate sign of election through the imitation of Christ, they still need guidance in the process of following His example through faith in action. Pastors are among a variety of leaders in the Church who offer guidance to believers, and enable them to eventually guide others in imitating Christ. In addition to offering guidance, Zwingli held that pastors led believers in an “organic” plan of reform that stressed changing institutions by changing people through pastoral relationships.³² However, his mentor Erasmus, believed that a good plan of reform should be more “mechanical,” and stressed changing people by changing institutions through educational systems.

³¹ Locher, 25

³² The researcher has drawn these terms from a panel discussion on ecclesiology at Bethel University in 2010. During this discussion, Thorsten Moritz used the term “organic” in regard to how 21st century Christians should seek to “be” and “do” Church.

Though the plans of Zwingli and Erasmus shared the goal of gradually reforming the Western Church, they each took a different approach. In accordance with the mechanical nature of his plan, Erasmus sought to reform the institutions of the Church, while Zwingli sought to reform the people of the Church in a natural, organic fashion. To reform institutions, Erasmus wrote in Greek and Latin to educated citizens and dominant religious authorities, which resulted in a small audience of elite supporters.³³ But, as Locher implies, to reform the people, Zwingli treated the Church as a holy society within a “great ecosystem” [God’s creation] suffering from imbalance:

Zwingli repeated it [the justification of the sinner by grace] on the level of community life: church, nation, and world, the communities of men, were the operating grounds for demons which could not be brought under control by the aid of education alone.³⁴

When Locher writes “demons” he is referring to sin and depravity, which began with the Fall of humanity in Genesis 3 and, as Paul shows in Romans 8:18-23, affected all of God’s creation. However, Zwingli believed that the creation, like all ecosystems, and in which Christian society was a member, had a natural God-given defense to restore balance. In his *Commentary on True and False Religion*, he tells the reader:

The second part of the gospel, then, is repentance: not that which takes place for a time, but that which makes a man who knows himself blush and be ashamed of his old life, for one reason because he sees it ought to be altogether foreign to a Christian to waste away in those sins from which he rejoiced to believe that he had been delivered....Therefore when Christ and John and the Apostles preach, saying, ‘Repent,’ they are simply calling us to a new life quite unlike our life before; and those who had undertaken to enter upon this were marked by an initiatory sacrament, baptism to wit, by which they give public testimony that they were going to enter upon a new life.³⁵

³³ Peter G. Wallace. *European History in Perspective: The Long European Reformation*, 70

³⁴ Locher, 25

³⁵ Ulrich Zwingli, *Commentary on True and False Religion*, 131–132

The name of this natural defense is repentance, which was the theme of the Reformation; in fact, the Reformation was a movement of repentance or turning away from sin and depravity.³⁶ Yet for Erasmus, a liberal education was the means of restoring balance, and in his *Declamation on the Subject of Early Liberal Education*, he states that generous love and careful instruction by parents and teachers would bring out the best in children.³⁷ In other words, the great humanist believed that a proper liberal education naturally entailed the concepts of redemption and repentance. So for Erasmus, as a person gained the right knowledge, their mind would be gradually renewed and they would (as the Apostle Paul writes in Romans 12:2) stop following the pattern of a sinful world.

On the surface, Erasmus' natural defense seems ideal, but for Zwingli it had two major flaws. The first flaw was that a liberal education was only accessible to those who could afford it. The second flaw was that it failed to acknowledge the widespread despair among educated Christians whose educational abilities were incapable of helping them with negative spiritual issues.³⁸ But above all, Zwingli disliked Erasmus' natural defense because it brought about reform too slowly when some situations called for immediate change. Therefore, repentance was a better defense for the greater ecosystem than education, for it entailed both gradual and immediate change, and most importantly, was constantly called for throughout the Bible (e.g., 2 Samuel 12:1-5 and Matthew 3:2) and freely accessible to all people.³⁹

³⁶ Locher, 25

³⁷ Erika Rummel, *The Erasmus Reader*, 65-100

³⁸ Locher, 25

³⁹ Samuel M. Jackson, *Ulrich Zwingli: On Providence and Other Essays*, 100

Since repentance, not a liberal education, was called for in Scripture then, for Zwingli, it was more than simply a better natural defense against sin and depravity. For the Reformer, repentance was the one and only defense, and perhaps this view comes from the influence of Erasmus on his theology. In his representation of God, Erasmus reduced the traditional attributes of God to the two concepts of justice and mercy, and gave God's mercy greater weight so that it predominated His justice.⁴⁰ Zwingli also held this representation of God, which resulted in a heavy emphasis on repentance that Samuel M. Jackson makes note of:

Justice and mercy are, therefore, so mingled that the latter should furnish the victim and the former should accept it for the expiation of all sins. Such being the central point of the Christian religion distinguished from religion in general, Zwingli is now prepared to define the Gospel, which he does in the words, "that in the name of Christ sins are remitted." But the fruits of this sacrifice become ours only upon the condition that we become new creatures, put on Christ, and so walk. Consequently the whole life of the Christian is a constant repentance.⁴¹

Thus, Zwingli sees repentance as the only defense against sin and depravity, and when done with sincerity it would produce a powerful change in individual and communal life. Upon actively turning from sin and depravity, repentant people could cease doing evil works and put their faith into action through the imitation of Christ. They could follow the example of Jesus through good works motivated by love for Him, works that would transform their churches, nations, and ultimately the world. Through repentance, people of all walks of life could look away from their sinful nature with

⁴⁰ Locher, 241

⁴¹ Samuel M. Jackson, *Huldreich Zwingli the Reformer of German Switzerland*, 386-387

humility, look to the Bible with understanding, joyfully conform their lives to the Word of God, and bring balance to His creation.

Truly, for Zwingli repentance was the one and only natural defense against sin and depravity, and out of this he sought to make his congregation a place of continuous repentance. After all, as Paul reveals in Ephesians 4:22-24, sin is a constant reality in daily life; therefore, repentance must also be a constant reality for those in Christ, no matter what order of society they belong to. In the medieval world, writers regularly divided society into three orders: *oratores* (those who pray), *bellatores* (those who fight) and *laborares* (those who work).⁴²

Within this three-fold division, medieval society was also split into three “churches,” which were the praying Church (clergy), the fighting Church (Christian nobility), and the toiling Church (common Christians). In Zwingli’s plan of reform, he seems to consolidate the orders of society and calls those within them to be one praying, fighting and working Church.⁴³ By consolidating the three orders, Zwingli not only redefines the medieval social order, but also the role of pastors. No longer are pastors to be a separate group of special Christians who simply pray for the laity, conduct religious ceremonies and (as the Erasmian plan would require) join the elite in educating simple minds to enlightenment. Instead, the notion of “special” and “common” Christians is erased and pastors are fellow members of one great community of Christ in a continuous

⁴²Jacques Le Goff, *Medieval Callings*, 11

⁴³ Samuel M. Jackson, *The Selected Works of Ulrich Zwingli*, 114

state of repentance.⁴⁴ Nevertheless, though the special and common distinction is erased, the distinction between clergy and laity is not erased but redefined.

Long before coming to his reformed views, Zwingli believed that as members of the Church, not just leaders, pastors must make repentance a constant reality in their daily personal lives. During his early years as a priest in Glarus and Einsiedeln, he engaged in sexual affairs with different women, which was a common practice among the clergy of his day. Nevertheless, as he sought to make Scripture more central in his theological development, he became aware of the reality of sin in his personal life and his need for repentance.⁴⁵ He also became aware of the need to be open and honest about his struggles (past and present) when questioned by others, and follow the words of James 5:16 which say, “Confess your sins to one another.” One example of this openness can be seen during his election to the office of People’s Priest at the Grossmünster. Christopher Catherwood writes:

His election, by seventeen votes to seven, was on 11 December 1518 and showed that he was not without opposition. There were rumors that he had wronged a woman....Morality among priests was not high, and in this Zwingli had failed to be no different. He was able to assure them, though, that such unchastity was now over.⁴⁶

In confessing to such an affair, Zwingli would have risked his chances of being elected to the office of People’s Priest. But rather than put on a saintly facade to defend himself, he presents his true self or struggles with sexual temptation to the Council of

⁴⁴ Jackson, 114

⁴⁵ Christopher Catherwood, *Five Leading Reformers*, 87

⁴⁶ Catherwood, 87

Zürich,⁴⁷ and upon seeing this they would have been greatly surprised. During the 16th century, parishioners confessed their sins to priests (not the other way around), and in confessing his past sexual sins to parishioners, Zwingli lives out the idea that clergy are not a separate class of Christians. Yet, even more than this, he further redefines the role of pastors, and contrary to the Medieval Church system, he does not see offering penance as the response to confession. Instead, he views encouraging the confessor to repentance as the right response, and the pastor does this by showing them what grace has bestowed upon them through Jesus Christ. In his *Commentary on True and False Religion*, Zwingli states that auricular confession or confession that is heard is:

Nothing but a consultation in which we receive, from him [the minister] whom God has appointed to the end that we may seek the law from his lips, advice as to how we can secure peace of mind. Behold the keys, therefore, behold the Gospel of which enough has been said. The minister of the Word, therefore, evangelizes you.⁴⁸

Upon hearing a person's confession, Zwingli believed that the pastor should respond with the Gospel, and not suggested works to "get right with God." After hearing the bad news of sin, the pastor should give the confessor the Good News of Jesus, which absolves them from the burden of guilt, and frees them to turn from the works of sin and depravity. Also, the pastor must respond with his or her own confession or be open and honest about his or her personal stories of repentance, and through this and the Gospel, the confessor is further encouraged to turn from the works of unrighteousness. They are further encouraged to repent, look to Jesus, and imitate Him through the good works of righteousness.

⁴⁷ Carter Lindberg, *The European Reformations*, pg. 164

⁴⁸ Harry E. Fosdick, *Great Voices of the Reformation*, 170

In Zwingli's thought, the role of the pastor is ultimately leading the church in a life of repentance, which Luther states is willed by Christ to be "the whole life of believers."⁴⁹ The pastor's role is to call those in Christ to turn from their sins through proclaiming the Gospel in preaching and being a living example of the transformation it brings through sharing their confession. The Good News had transformed the Reformer from a selfish young priest lost in sexual sin, to a faithful (though not perfect) minister of Christ with a steadfast commitment to the well-being of others. But apart from proclaiming the Gospel through preaching and revealing its transformative power through their confession, pastors also do these things through living a "confessional life." A confessional life is, as defined by the Presbyterian Book of Confessions, a life where Christians openly affirm, declare, acknowledge or take a stand for what they believe to be true.⁵⁰

In a confessional life, pastors openly affirm, declare, and acknowledge the belief that repentance is to be the whole life of believers. Moreover, through a confessional life, pastors show the laity first-hand what a life of repentance looks like. As parishioners encounter pastors outside of the sanctuary from Monday to Saturday, they are to see fellow believers constantly striving to put up the only defense (repentance) against sin and depravity, despite their imperfections. They are to see fellow believers motivated by love for Jesus as they turn from sin, put away unrighteous deeds and experience transformation through His Gospel. Above all, they are to see fellow believers imitating

⁴⁹ In Luther's 95 theses, his first thesis is, "When our Lord and Master Jesus Christ said, 'Repent' (Mt 4:17), He willed the entire life of believers to be one of repentance."

⁵⁰ PCUSA, *Book of Confessions 1999*, xiv

Jesus through good works that bring about change (or reformation) in the Church and society at large; works that put faith into action and restore balance to God's creation.

Truly, Zwingli believed that a pastor's role is leading the Church in a life of repentance so that their fellow-believers might follow the example of Jesus (the living Word of God) and put their faith into action. Out of this belief, he composed a prayer that he often prayed while working alone and with others, which says:

Almighty, eternal and merciful God, whose Word is a lamp unto our feet and a light unto our path, open and illuminate our minds, that we may purely and perfectly understand your Word and that our lives may be conformed to what we have rightly understood, that in nothing we may be displeasing to your majesty, through Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.⁵¹

Conclusion: A Summary of Zwingli's Views of Faith in Action

In summary, Zwingli's view of faith in action begins with Christ and trickles down to His Church. Christ as the "perfect exemplar of all virtues" is the ultimate example of what it means to live out faith, and by imitating Him, believers follow His example. Nevertheless, from Zwingli's perspective, the imitation of Christ is more than simply "aping Jesus" or repeating His actions. The imitation of Christ is the ultimate sign of election by God, a response to His work of salvation, and the means by which faith is put into action. In other words, if people are truly saved, they will respond to God's grace by living out their faith through seeking to live as Jesus lived.

In the process of putting faith into action, Christians still need guidance, and this is where Zwingli saw the need for pastors. Through pastoral relationships with parishioners, those within the clergy model out what it means to imitate Christ. They

⁵¹ J. R. Estrep Jr., M. J. Anthony, and G.R. Allison, *A Theology for Christian Education*, 157

show believers by example how to follow the ultimate example of faith in action. In addition to the guidance they give, pastors enable parishioners to guide others in putting faith into action through the imitation of Jesus.

CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter focuses on countering certain misconceptions so that a clearer picture of Zwingli and his relationship to John Calvin might emerge. The author also highlights the pastoral visions of Zwingli and Calvin, and presents the possible implications of bringing them together. The ultimate aim of exploring and merging these visions is to build and present a case for bringing Zwinglian thought into Reformed pastoral theology, which is currently dominated by Calvinistic thought. As for Zwingli's sacramental views, the researcher found that conflicting opinions among scholars made it difficult to conduct an independent study. Therefore, the subject of the Reformer's sacramentality was explored during interviews with leading authorities in Zwingli studies and shall be addressed in chapter five. In this chapter the researcher will show how Zwingli's pastoral vision and insights can enrich pastoral ministry and help to address modern pastoral concerns.

Third Man of the Reformation

In what Jean Rillet calls the "Reformation hierarchy," Zwingli is often labeled the "third man" of the Reformation, with Martin Luther taking first place and John Calvin taking second. Zwingli is placed third because the impact of his reforming work was not as widespread as that of Luther or Calvin. Luther's Ninety-five theses set off a chain reaction across Europe that caught the attention of the Holy Roman Emperor, and Calvin's ideas made Geneva a place of refuge for fellow Reformers and persecuted

Protestants from all across Europe. Unlike his fellow Reformers, Zwingli's work had a more local emphasis, which led to a sharp focus on the Swiss-German Confederation and the concerns of its people.¹ In fact, he was so focused on the Swiss-German context that in the original Zürich Bible (where he used Alemannic German and Swiss imagery), Zwingli translates Psalm 23:2 as "In schöner Alp weidet er mich," which means, "In the beautiful Alps He tends me."²

In addition to a reforming work that was not so widespread, Zwingli also takes third place because he left no official catechisms and ecclesiastical structures that espoused his ideas as did Luther and Calvin. It would be safe to say that if Zwingli had survived the battle of Kappel, where he met an early death, he might have gone about the tasks of drafting a systematic theology, Church orders and catechisms. Nevertheless, his contemporaries were able to record their theological contributions in writing, and the most influential of the three is undoubtedly John Calvin.³ In fact, Calvin has contributed so much to the Reformed tradition that it is often seen as synonymous with his theological perspective [Calvinism].

Calvin single-handedly systematized much of Reformed theology in his famous *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, which are used by Reformed Churches to this very day. And despite some input from Heinrich Bullinger (Zwingli's successor as pastor of the Grossmünster), it was Calvin who drafted the *Consensus Tigurinus*, which united the Swiss-German and Swiss-French Protestant Churches and brought about more

¹ Paul Spickard and K. M. Cragg, *A Global History of Christians: How Everyday Believers Experienced their World*, 181

² Bard Thompson, *Humanist And Reformers: A History of the Renaissance and Reformation*, 439

³ J. L. Gonzáles, *The Story of Christianity: Volume 2*, 61

understanding between the Reformed and Lutheran Churches in regard to the Eucharist.⁴ Due to his many contributions, Calvin is sometimes referred to as the “founder of the Reformed faith,” while Zwingli is simply seen as his forerunner.⁵ Certainly the Genevan Reformer is credibly deemed as founder as a result of European authorities (e.g., the Kingdom of the Netherlands, Frederick III of Simmern and the Long Parliament of Cromwell England) embracing his theological perspective.⁶

Under the supervision of the aforementioned authorities, almost all the major classic Reformed confessions and catechisms were drafted, with Calvinism as their theological base. The only confessions and catechisms that are Zwinglian are Zwingli’s *Sixty-Seven Articles* and *Confession of Faith to Emperor Charles V*, the *Tetrapolitan Confession*, and the short confessions and catechisms of Johannes Oecolampadius, Leo Juda and Heinrich Bullinger. Despite being the first of their kind in the Reformed tradition, the Zwinglian confessions and catechisms were later overshadowed by their Calvinist counterparts, which seemed to have a clearer logical flow. In the end, much like Lutheranism, various European authorities helped Calvinism gain its current high regard over Zwinglianism, and as Willem Balke points out, helped to make it the “standard/orthodox” perspective of the Reformed tradition.⁷

⁴ Philip Schaff, “The Consensus of Zurich. A.D. 1549.” *Creeds of Christendom, with a History and Critical Notes I*. 472.

⁵ H. J. Selderhuis, *The Calvin Handbook*, 93

⁶ Earle E. Cairns, *Christianity through the Centuries: A History of the Christian Church*, 311, 317

⁷ Willem Balke, Interview, Den Haag, July 18, 2011.

According to Balke, Calvin is often seen as a “conservative” who is more biblical, while Zwingli is seen as a “liberal” who misuses Scripture for patriotic purposes.⁸ He also states that the assertion of a conservative Calvin and liberal Zwingli has kept Reformed pastors from understanding both Reformers in context and accessing important insights that might enrich their ministries. In fact, he is taking part in a growing effort among Reformed theologians, which aiming to brush away widespread misunderstandings of Calvin’s life and thought through various research projects.

Just as there is a growing effort to rethink how Calvin is understood, there is also a growing effort to rethink how Zwingli is understood and how he relates to his Genevan contemporary.⁹ Along with the Reformation hierarchy, the assumption of a conservative Calvin and liberal Zwingli has elevated the former over the latter and made one appear more trustworthy than the other. Furthermore, the hierarchy and common assumption have presented the Reformers’ theological perspectives as being at odds and almost incompatible.

The Place of Zwingli and Calvin within the Reformed Tradition

In Zwingli and Calvin studies, there is currently a growing effort to get a clearer picture of both Reformers by brushing away widespread misunderstandings of their lives and perspectives. Quite often Zwingli and his insights are wrongly viewed as being more innovative while Calvin and his insights are viewed as being more biblical, and this false perception has led numerous Reformed thinkers to deem the former in a less favorable

⁸ Balke

⁹ William S. Maltby, *Reformation Europe: A Guide to Research - Volume 3*, 47

light than the latter. Since Calvin's writings tend to address a wider audience, then Zwingli (who mainly writes for a Swiss-German audience) is also seen as too narrow in focus and therefore less reliable. Apart from audiences, what makes the third man less reliable is, as Catherwood writes, the paradox that he embodies.¹⁰ Unlike Calvin, who died in his bed after a scholarly life with a Bible and quill, Zwingli died in battle wielding the sword of war after a life of pacifism with the sword of the Spirit.¹¹ In regard to his pacifism, Zwingli also seems to embody an almost unforgivable hypocrisy for the part he played in the persecution of his former students (e.g., Felix Manz) and their Anabaptist followers.¹²

As Richard Muller points out in his critique of the “Calvin against the Calvinists” theory, defining the Reformed faith in terms of Calvin's thought alone is a grave historical error and wrongly gives him the place of founder.¹³ In truth, Calvin's place within the Reformed tradition can be likened to a jeweler who makes a rough diamond into a faceted gem while Zwingli is the miner who discovered and extracted it. And furthermore, despite his immense work, Calvin is just one of several jewelers who went about the tasks of cleaving, shaping, polishing and inspecting the raw diamond of the Reformed faith. Zwingli is the founder of the Reformed tradition while Calvin is but one of several younger contemporaries who further developed it through their own ideas.

¹⁰ Catherwood, 79

¹¹ Richard Davis, *How Zurich Changed the World*, 8

¹² Sam Storms, *Zwingli and the Anabaptists*, www.samstorms.com/all-articles/post/zwilingli-and-anabaptists (accessed October 16, 2014)

¹³ Richard A. Muller, *Calvin And the Reformed Tradition: On the Work of Christ and the Order of Salvation*, 59

Along with defining the Reformed faith solely in terms of Calvin's thought, it is also just as grave of an error for one to define it solely in terms of Zwingli's thought. One helpful illustration of this is a house or family that is established by a founder and expands over time through the birth of descendants. The Reformed tradition was established through Zwinglianism and expanded through the birth of its contemporary perspectives, such as Calvinism. Just as a founder alone is not the family he or she establishes, Zwinglianism alone is not the Reformed family. In other words, one cannot have the Reformed tradition without Zwinglianism, Calvinism and the perspectives of other founding Reformed thinkers together. A failure to do this would result in repeating the mistakes made by many of Calvin's contemporaries in a Zwinglian fashion. In light of this, the researcher concludes that defining the Reformed faith through Zwingli alone would be deeming him as more trustworthy than Calvin and downplaying Calvin's contributions, role and voice within the Reformed tradition.

Liberal Zwinglianism, Conservative Calvinism

In an interview with Philip Ruediger (who pastors a free-Reformed Church in Switzerland), the researcher learned that many theologically Reformed Swiss pastors see the relationship between Zwingli and Calvin's perspectives like two sides of a coin.¹⁴ On one side there is the Zürich tradition of German-speaking Switzerland, and on the other side there is the Geneva tradition of French-speaking Switzerland. Ruediger believes that Churches within the Zürich tradition need to look more to Calvin whose works better articulate the Reformed faith than those of Zwingli.

¹⁴ Phillip Ruediger, interviewed by Scotty Williams, Gränichen, CH, April 13, 2012

At the close of the interview, the researcher found that Ruediger also held the common misconception that Calvin is more reliable than Zwingli, and his rationale stems from Karl Barth's praise of the Geneva Reformer. In a letter to Eduard Thurneysen, Barth writes that Calvin, "is a cataract, a primeval forest, a demonic power, something directly down from the Himalayas, absolutely Chinese, strange, mythological." Barth also writes that he would gladly and profitably spend the rest of life only studying the works of Calvin.¹⁵

But in fairness to Ruediger's appreciation of Calvin, he also showed an admiration of Zwingli and expressed a need for Zwinglianism and Calvinism in Swiss-German Reformed Churches. Since beginning his own pastoral work in Switzerland the researcher has also observed this need, and has found that some pastors within the Zürich tradition tend to treat Calvin in the same manner in which Zwingli is treated in Calvinistic circles. Upon entering the IPC Zürich community, the researcher often observed that his Swiss-German colleagues tended to see Calvin as less reliable due to his more exclusive views of Church which, as Robert Walton points out, both Zwingli and Bullinger opposed.¹⁶

Neither Zwingli nor Bullinger could accept Calvin's belief that a godly magistrate could take part in church discipline to prevent the corruption of a whole society. They also rejected the belief of Calvin's successor, Theodore Beza, that those who treat the Church with contempt also treat God with contempt. Walton writes that Bullinger

¹⁵ James D. Smart, *Revolutionary Theology in the Making: Barth-Thurneysen Correspondence 1924-1925*, 101

¹⁶ Robert C. Walton, "The Institutionalization of the Reformation in Zürich," *Zwingliana*, 13, no. 8 (May 1972) 497-515

interpreted Calvin and Beza's views as the demand for a new form of "papal tyranny" enforced by means such as excommunication and barring from the Eucharist.

Writing a few years before his death, Bullinger asserted that Zürich had never had a Presbytery and neither he nor anyone else in the city wanted a discipline beyond that which was acceptable to the law of the Christian magistrate and could be administered by him.¹⁷

In following the more inclusive view of Church that Zwingli and Bullinger espoused, those within the Zürich tradition and other traditions of the Reformed faith have deemed Calvin as being too exclusive.¹⁸ But despite its openness, Ruediger has stated that a rejection of Calvin's view of the Church has at times led the Zürich tradition to be too inclusive in situations that call for more exclusivity. One current example of the need for exclusivity in the Zürich tradition is the issue of openly atheist parishioners who receive ordination and proceed to lead churches.¹⁹ Though such clergy can be helpful in creating dialogue between the church and the atheist and agnostic communities, their presence also creates tension within active believing congregations.

When speaking of inclusivity and exclusivity in the Zürich and Geneva traditions, the researcher is not making reference to the classic paradigm of liberal and conservative theology. Instead, these terms are all about how congregations wrestle with the closed and open elements of Church life as they face specific situations. A classic example of "closed elements," pertaining to the Genevan church, would be excommunication, while "open elements," pertaining to the church of Zürich, would be things such as open

¹⁷ Walton, 497-515

¹⁸ Richard A. Muller, *Calvin and the Reformed Tradition*, 59

¹⁹ Deborah Sutter, "Dieser Pfarrer sagt: Gott existiert nicht." *20 Minuten*, April 5, 2013, <http://www.20min.ch/schweiz/news/story/Dieser-Pfarrer-sagt---Gott-existiert-nicht--13867607>

communion. Nevertheless, in using these terms one must avoid the assumption that one tradition is fully closed while the other is fully open. For example, in the 19th century, much of the Swiss-French Church embraced a more inclusive Unitarian theology, and in the 20th century the Swiss-German Church saw the advent of Karl Barth and Emil Brunner's more exclusive Neo-Orthodoxy.²⁰

Though the Zurich and Geneva traditions are each oriented to a specific element of Church life, they are not completely fixed within them; furthermore, both Zwingli and Calvin were not as rigid in their views as is often portrayed. For example, as Anthony Hoekema points out, when talking about non-Christians and truth Calvin departs from his usual exclusive view and presents a more inclusive view.²¹ In the *Institutes* the Reformer says:

Whenever, therefore, we meet with heathen writers, let us learn from that light of truth which is admirably displayed in their works that the human mind, fallen as it is, and corrupted from its integrity, is yet invested and adorned by God with excellent talents. If we believe that the Spirit of God is the only fountain of truth, we shall neither reject nor despise the truth itself, wherever it shall appear, unless we wish to insult the Spirit of God; for the gifts of the Spirit cannot be undervalued without offering contempt and reproach to the Spirit himself.²²

In light of examples such as Calvin's view of truth, the researcher holds that it is better to view Calvinism and Zwinglianism as representing the open and closed elements of the Reformed tradition. As was previously shown, the Zürich and Geneva traditions are not completely fixed in their elements and views, and the researcher concludes that this in turn brings a balance between them that leaves room for honest critique and enriching dialogue. Also, replacing the terms liberal and conservative with open and

²⁰ Jean-Henri Merle d'Aubigné, *For God and His People*, 16

²¹ Anthony Hoekema, *The Bible and the Future*, 74

²² John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 319

closed presents Zwinglianism in a language and classification that is not off-putting to those within Calvinist circles.

Zwingli's Influence on Calvin

Apart from getting a clearer picture of the relationship between Zwingli, Calvin and their respective theologies, it is also important to get a clearer picture in regard to how the former influenced the latter. As Calvin's reforming work began five years after the Battle of Kappel, there is no possible way that he influenced Zwingli. But despite his lack of influence on the Zürich Reformer, there is some evidence that Calvin was influenced by the Zürich tradition and interacted with Zwinglian thought by way of Zwingli's writings and Bullinger. At the 2014 *International Congress on Calvin Research*, Peter Opitz of the University of Zürich's theological faculty stated that Calvin rarely named his influences, but his reading of the Bible seems to be influenced by the Zürich tradition.²³ Also, according to Randall Zachman in his book *John Calvin and Roman Catholicism*, Zwingli also influenced Calvin in his views of idolatry:

Since Calvin not only read the *Civitas Dei* but also quoted it fairly often, we can safely assume that he deliberately rejected this theory [from St. Augustine] on the demonic origin of religion and forged ahead with a quite different hypothesis, which excluded demons altogether. This is exactly what Zwingli and Bullinger did too, so in this respect Calvin chose to follow his Reformed mentors much more closely than Augustine and the Catholic tradition.²⁴

²³ Peter Opitz, "Calvin in the Context of the Swiss Reformation" (lecture, International University of Zürich, Zürich, CH, August 24, 2014).

²⁴ Randall C. Zachman, *John Calvin and Roman Catholicism*, 159

Despite the influence of his predecessor, Calvin regarded Zwingli as a sub-par theologian and even ridiculed his theological methods and perspective. In his book titled, *Calvin in Context*, David Steinmetz makes mention of Calvin's personal views of Zwingli:

Calvin regarded Zwingli as a second-rate theologian and ridiculed the esteem in which he was held at Zürich. Though Calvin read and cited Zwingli's important treatise, the *Commentary on True and False Religion*, he confessed that he was put off by Zwingli's reliance upon philosophy, his excessive use of paradox, and his confusion of the universal concerns of the Gospel with the parochial concerns of the Swiss.²⁵

In light of Steinmetz's words, one can see another possible reason why Zwingli is deemed as less reliable, and that is Calvin's personal opinions of him. In light of this, the researcher believes that it is safe to say that by deeming Zwingli as "second-rate," and openly ridiculing his ideas, Calvin unintentionally relegated him the "third man of the Reformation." Nevertheless, as Opitz has pointed out, over the course of his life Calvin did grow to better acknowledge Zwingli and see him from a more positive viewpoint.²⁶ There are also points where, as Colin Smith writes, he eventually came to agree with parts of Zwingli's perspective, such as the necessity of sacraments in assuring the believer of his or her salvation.²⁷

Calvin's gradual acknowledgement of Zwingli and his perspective enabled him to better work with Zürich theologians in an honest and open dialogue. This dialogue

²⁵ David C. Steinmetz, *Calvin in Context*, 172-173

²⁶ Opitz, "Calvin in the Context of the Swiss Reformation"

²⁷ Colin D. Smith, *The Sacramental Theology of the Reformers*, 19

eventually led to the Reformed Churches of Switzerland being brought into unity under the *Consensus Tigurinus* of 1551.

Contexts: Local Zwingli, Foreign Calvin

Like all theologians, Zwingli and Calvin ministered to and formulated theology within specific contexts. To make use of Clemens Sedmak's terminology, Zwingli was a "local theologian" raised in a Swiss village while Calvin was a "foreign theologian" raised in a French city.²⁸ Unlike Zwingli, Calvin was a trained lawyer, and prior to entering the ministry, had no official pastoral training or experience. In fact, despite the knowledge he displays in his *Institutes*, much of Calvin's early pastoral work (which resulted in his expulsion from Geneva) was highly theoretical and untested. As for Zwingli, he had taken up holy orders, and prior to his life of following the Bible, often broke his priestly vows. Nevertheless, his early pastoral work (which resulted in his expulsion from Glarus) was highly practical and based on personal experience.²⁹

As a French exile living in Switzerland, Calvin had difficulty understanding Zwingli's more narrow view of the Gospel's dimensions and sole focus on Swiss concerns. In Calvin's time, the persecution of non-Catholics in Europe had greatly increased, and Geneva had become a safe haven for many displaced Protestants seeking asylum (e.g., John Knox fleeing the Marian persecution).³⁰ Due to his own experience as an immigrant, and his daily work with refugees, Calvin could not afford to think about

²⁸ Clemens Sedmak, *Doing Local Theology: A Guide for Artisans of a New Humanity*, 15

²⁹ Catherwood, 87

³⁰ Justo L. González, *The Story of Christianity –Volume 2*, 82

only parochial Swiss concerns in his pastoral work. Calvin's main pastoral concern within his Genevan context was to encourage and defend the persecuted Protestants of Europe, and this called for a clear systematic expression of faith and official codes of conduct that brought order to communal life and further established the Church. In addition, Calvin's main concern required taking his message outside of Switzerland, and building an academy to train pastors that would establish and lead Reformed communities across the continent.³¹

Calvin addresses his main pastoral concern in his sermon titled, "*On Suffering Persecution*," which was published and sent throughout Europe. After expounding upon the harshness and bitterness of persecution, he encourages the Protestants of Europe to consider how they might fortify themselves with patience and to expose their life for the truth of God.³² Throughout this sermon, the Reformer stresses to his audience that, according to the Scriptures, Christians are called to suffer. He also states that suffering is part of one's identity as a Christian, and the road by which believers must travel in following Christ.

Truly Calvin had a broader view of the Gospel's dimensions than Zwingli, but as a native-Swiss, the Zürich Reformer saw less of a need for it due to his focus on the sufferings of his people, incidentally from non-Swiss issues. In fact, it was non-Swiss concerns that sparked his call for reform in the first place, and the most pressing of these was mercenary service, to which he witnessed thousands of young Swiss men lose their

³¹ Frank James III, "Calvin the Evangelist," *Reformed Quarterly*, 19, no. 2/3 (Fall 1988) <http://rq.rts.edu/fall01/james.html> (accessed October 20, 2014).

³² An English translation of this sermon may be found in Warren W. Wiersbe's, *Treasury of the World's Greatest Sermons*.

lives in foreign wars.³³ Also, the mercenary service gave birth to a rapid decline in morality which led to problems such as gang violence among youth in the urban areas of Switzerland.³⁴

Due to the negative effects of foreign issues upon his people and his personal experiences with them, Zwingli primarily focused on local Swiss concerns as he went about pastoring. There are instances where he reaches out beyond his context, such as his *Confession of Faith to Emperor Charles V*, but his main pastoral concern was bringing his people the Word of God and alleviating their diverse sufferings.³⁵ His main pastoral concern was protecting his people as he guided them in the process of understanding the Gospel, conforming their lives to it and putting their faith into action. Unlike his contemporary, Zwingli's context called for more practical sermons in the Swiss-German dialect and writing to address the local issues of his people.³⁶ Also his context called for making use of local structures and methods, such as disputations before the Zürich Council, and implementing reforms by popular vote when the people seemed ready for them.

In the end, Zwingli and Calvin were not the theologians they were simply because of their distinct personalities, but because of what their contexts needed and required of them. During Zwingli's time, Switzerland needed a theologian who could speak in a way that gave its people enough self-worth to stop "selling their blood for gold" and instead

³³ Potter, 35

³⁴ D'Aubigné, 16

³⁵ Potter, 418

³⁶ Catherwood, 81

adopt a nurturing way of life that built up their community.³⁷ And during Calvin's time, Switzerland needed a theologian who could speak in a way that opened people's eyes to the universal dimensions of the Gospel, and compelled them take up an empathetic way of life that gives refuge and comfort to suffering communities. In other words, both Reformers were actively true to their context, and like all good theologians they faced certain struggles within themselves while working to address pastoral concerns.

As Zwingli sought to be true to his context, his greatest personal struggle was his staunch patriotism, which hindered his efforts to alleviate his people's sufferings and give them the Word of God.³⁸ In his biography of the Zürich Reformer, D'Aubigné makes it clear that, due to his uncontrolled love for his country, Zwingli bears much responsibility for the outbreak of Swiss religious wars. While Zürich's fellow Protestant cantons, for the sake of preserving their country's unity, resisted the Catholic cantons by peaceful blockades, Zwingli chastised them for not taking up arms. He, as D'Aubigné shows, allowed his patriotism to transform him from a pacifist preacher who fostered unity, to a warring nationalist who helped divide the country he loved.

As for Calvin, his greatest personal struggle was vanity and inflexibility, which stemmed from an overconfidence in his logical mind and a lack of compromise while implementing reforms. Evidence of this struggle can be seen in his expulsion from Geneva, which may have partly resulted from an unwillingness to see the flaws in his first reforming program.³⁹ Though his intentions behind introducing the practice of

³⁷ D'Aubigné, 16

³⁸ D'Aubigné, 216-217

³⁹ H.J. Selderhuis, *John Calvin: A Pilgrim's Life*, 83

excommunication were biblical, the method of implementation was too harsh. He was thoroughly convinced of his correctness insomuch that he, as González points out, became unwilling to meet parishioners where they were in their objections. *González* writes that upon learning of Calvin's plan to implement the practice of excommunicating unrepentant sinners, the government, then in the hands of the bourgeoisie, refused to allow it. The government's main objection to excommunication was that it had the appearance of an unwarranted rigorism. In response to their objection Calvin insisted on his position and refused to compromise, which resulted in his expulsion from Geneva and banishment to Strasbourg.⁴⁰

The inflexible way in which Calvin implemented reforms ultimately worked against him, for he failed to win over the Genevan bourgeoisie who sought a libertine Christianity with no obligations.⁴¹ But more than likely, this lack of flexibility stemmed from insufficient pastoral experience, which he gained while pastoring a French-speaking congregation in Strasbourg.⁴² Yet even more than practical experience, Calvin learned to put aside his vanity, do local theology as a foreign theologian, and work on behalf of the context he was placed in with grace and flexibility. He went from seeing Geneva as a "cross" to bear, and began to adapt to its local conditions that he might build up the community.⁴³ Like Zwingli, he learned to meet parishioners in their context and contextualize the Gospel that they might understand and embrace it, and address their

⁴⁰ González, *The Story of Christianity –Volume 2*, 65-66

⁴¹ Richard T. Stevenson, *John Calvin: The Statesman*, Chapter VIII

⁴² Herman Selderhuis, *Calvinus Clarrismus Theologus: Papers of the 10th International Congress on Calvin Research*, 36

⁴³ T.H.L. Parker, *John Calvin: A Biography*, 105

local issues as he sought to address the broader issues of persecuted Protestants across Europe.⁴⁴ In contrast to his predecessor, Calvin had no patriotism to blind him, and this in turn enabled him to reconcile the universal dimensions of the Gospel within the particular dimensions of his context. Perhaps if Zwingli had lived longer, he too would have overcome his greatest personal struggle, and gained the ability to do theology outside of his context.

Pastoral Visions

In order to build a Zwinglian template of pastoral ministry to complement the Reformed tradition's dominant Calvinistic template, the researcher had to explore the pastoral visions of Zwingli and Calvin. A pastoral vision is defined as the essence of and driving theme behind a pastor's ministry; this vision also helps one to understand how a pastor views him or herself and any specific ministerial emphases. In the case of Zwingli, he views himself as a "shepherd pastor" who leads the church for Christ the great shepherd. But Calvin, on the other hands, views himself as a "watchdog pastor" who keeps the Church following Christ the great Shepherd.⁴⁵

The ways in which both Reformers view themselves stems from their respective pastoral visions, which the researcher sought to understand. By exploring these visions, he was able to see the essence of Zwingli and Calvin's ministries and the ethos behind each Reformer's pastoral emphases. But most importantly, the researcher was able to see how the pastoral views of Zwingli could complement those of Calvin.

⁴⁴ Donald K. McKim, *The Cambridge Companion to John Calvin*, 207-208

⁴⁵ Selderhuis, 22

Zwingli's Pastoral Vision

If Zwingli's pastoral vision could be summed up in one word it would have to be "renewal." For the Zürich Reformer, the Christian life was about believers looking to the Word of God, understanding it by the Holy Spirit, seeing God's decrees or promises, and living on earth in accordance with these promises by faith.⁴⁶ The driving force behind living in accordance with God's promises is love for Him and other human beings; as believers lived this way, they would bring renewal to their land, changing it from one influenced by sin to a land under God's influence.⁴⁷ In other words, Zwingli's pastoral vision was all about getting believers to collectively "heal the land" through faith in action motivated by love. Being a classical humanist, his vision partly stems from a positive view of humanity tempered by the belief that without God's truth in the Bible, people are prone to nothing but error.

In regard to his humanist views, Zwingli parts ways with Augustine, and rejects the concept of original guilt.⁴⁸ To clarify, he does not reject the entire concept of original sin, but instead sees the transgression of Adam and Eve in Genesis 3 as more of a disease. The parents of humanity are solely responsible for bringing sin into the world, and their descendants have merely contracted it. In *A Theology for the Church*, Daniel Alkin gives a good summary of Zwingli's views of sin and guilt:

Ulrich Zwingli defined *sin* in a twofold way. First sin is a "disease which we contract from the author of our race, in consequence of which we are given over to love for ourselves....This defect is a disease native to us in consequence of

⁴⁶ Samuel M. Jackson, *Ulrich Zwingli: Early Writings*, 6

⁴⁷ Fritz Büsser lays out Zwingli's pastoral vision in, "*The Shepherd – Who is the True Pastor?*"

⁴⁸ Alister E. McGrath, *Christian Theology: An Introduction*, 530

which we shun things hard and burdensome and pursue things pleasant and agreeable.”⁴⁹

For Zwingli, sin was a spiritual defect that was transmitted in the same way a congenital disease is transmitted from parent to child. Just as children cannot be condemned for receiving a congenital disease, the depravity of human beings from the sin of their foreparents is uncondemnable. Therefore, as Alkin writes, Zwingli held that “human beings are neither guilty nor condemned for their depravity. Original sin is a pollution of human nature, but not an actual, culpable transgression.”⁵⁰

As was said in chapter two, Zwingli’s plan of reform was organic in nature, and sought to restore balance to the ecosystem of God’s creation that had been damaged by sin. In response to the disease of sin, God offers the atonement of Christ as medicine to a fallen humanity. Therefore repentance, which Zwingli sees as a God-given defense against sin, is the means by which humanity takes the medicine of Christ. As for the Gospel, Zwingli views it as the diagnosis of humanity’s disease, and the pastor gives this diagnosis through preaching. In, *The Shepherd* Zwingli writes:

Following that, he [the pastor] should begin to preach as Christ began: “Repent!” (Matthew 4:17.) It was with this form that the forerunner John the Baptist also began. (Cf. Matthew 3:2.) Now no one will repent who does not know how evil he is. Therefore, here must sin be preached, and then salvation. Let no one here be led astray by the fact that Christ says in Matthew 10:7 and Mark 16:15 to preach only salvation or the Gospel. For always the illness must be recognized before one takes the medicine.⁵¹

⁴⁹ Here Alkin makes a direct quote from Zwingli’s, *Commentary on True and False Religion*.

⁵⁰ Daniel Alkin, *A Theology for the Church*, 437

⁵¹ H. Wayne Pipkin, *Huldrych Zwingli: Selected Writings - Volume 2*, 21-37

Though Zwingli's pastoral vision is all about renewal, its salvific language is not the typical legal language of Western Christianity, but the medical language of Eastern Christianity. More than likely he gets this language from his readings of the Greek Church Father Origen, whom he quotes frequently throughout his writings.⁵² Also, Zwingli's writings and beliefs about sin seem to imply, he does not solely subscribe to the satisfaction theory of atonement. The researcher would argue that, although he affirms Christ making satisfaction for the sins of God's elect, Zwingli subscribes to what Bruce Reichenbach calls the *healing theory* of atonement.⁵³ This theory is based in Eastern Christian thought, uses medical salvific language, and deems sin as a sickness which God works to heal so that shalom – well-being, wholeness, and peace – might be restored to His people and Creation.⁵⁴ Like all theories, the healing theory of atonement has its weaknesses, but there are two positive consequences that can have a powerful impact on one's pastoral vision. According to Reichenbach, these implications are:

Shalom of the spirit - The assurance that sins are forgiven and that humanity can have a restored relationship with God. The result of this restoration is the freedom not to sin, but to live a life of righteousness (2 Corinthians 5:21), and service to God and others (Romans 6:1, 12:1-2).

Shalom of humanity's physical and social being - The assurance that in sickness, suffering, calamity and hardship, God desires well-being for and seeks the good of humanity.⁵⁵

⁵² Irena D. Backus, *The Reception of the Church Fathers in the West - From the Carolingians to the Maurists: Volume I*, 638

⁵³ Donald K. McKim, *Major Themes in the Reformed Tradition*, 117

⁵⁴ James Beilby and Paul R. Eddy, *The Nature of the Atonement*, 117-142

⁵⁵ Beilby and Eddy, 117-142

In addition, intercession, praise for healing and arguing with God (Luke 11:5-8) are consistent with the atonement in the healing theory according to Reichenbach.⁵⁶

Throughout Zwingli's pastoral vision of renewal, one can see the positive consequences of the healing theory of atonement. By way of this theory, Zwingli's makes the pastor a spiritual physician who, through the revelation of the Gospel in preaching, helps those with the disease of sin to see the remedy in Jesus Christ. Upon getting people to take this remedy and find healing through repentance, Zwingli believed that the pastor must also lead them to be agents of healing through a ministry of reconciliation. Fritz Büsser writes that reconciliation for Zwingli entailed "a devotion to all those in this world who are miserable, sick, imprisoned and persecuted, burdened and suffering."⁵⁷ Along with this devotion, the ministry of reconciliation also involved social justice, the prophetic task of fighting against violence and vices, and an inexorable opposition against self-interest, avarice, envy, pride, and especially against any form of hypocrisy and idolatry.

As the pastor led repentant believers in the ministry of reconciliation, the end result would be a renewal of society driven by love. The end result of God's people being agents of healing through social justice would be a faith in action that transformed and restored shalom to the earth. Nevertheless, since Zwingli was primarily a local theologian with parochial concerns, then his pastoral vision is too narrow in scope and only focuses on changing the pastor's context. This narrowness can be a strength in giving pastors reasonable goals, but it runs the risk of being too inward focused and blinding them to the

⁵⁶ Beilby and Eddy, 117-142

⁵⁷ Büsser, "The Shepherd – Who is the True Pastor?"

universal concerns and dimensions of the Gospel. Therefore, it needs to be balanced with the pastoral vision of Calvin, which is broader in scope.

Calvin's Pastoral Vision

Nearly all Reformed pastors in training are required to read Calvin's *Institutes* where, apart from his lectures and sermons, he lays out his pastoral theology. One of the best summaries of Calvin's pastoral theology is Shawn D. Wright's, *John Calvin as Pastor*, where he presents the Reformer's pastoral vision through the theme of "pilgrimage." According to Wright, Calvin's vision is ultimately about the pastor giving people the knowledge of God and self and helping them along in a difficult journey that leads to restoration in heaven. Wright presents this vision through five key aspects, which are God-centeredness, a robust view of humanity, faith in Christ, the Christian life as pilgrimage and an eternal scope.⁵⁸

According to Wright, Calvin's pastoral vision begins with the idea that everything revolves around God, and that humanity is obligated to know Him and show Him adoration through veneration of worship. Nevertheless, the Geneva Reformer believed that in order to know and rightly worship God, human beings (who are complicated creatures) must also know themselves. By gaining the knowledge of self, human beings could see their sinfulness and need for salvation, which comes from union with Christ through trusting in His death by faith. For Calvin, trusting in the death of Christ was the defining point of what it means to be a Christian, and along with this trust, true Christians

⁵⁸ Shawn D. Wright, "John Calvin as Pastor," *Southern Baptist Journal of Theology* 13, no. 4 (Winter 2009) 6-9

would embark upon a difficult journey, or “pilgrimage,” that led to heaven. This pilgrimage is the Christian life, and it is laden with forces intent on extinguishing one’s faith in Christ. Nevertheless, Calvin held that if Christian pilgrims constantly reminded themselves of their heavenly destination, they could endure the forces against them and persevere until the end.

At first glance, Calvin’s pastoral vision can look like an elaborate theological dismissal and demeaning of God’s creation and life on earth. In fact, some popular Christian thinkers, such as Rachel Held Evans interpret Calvin’s vision in this way, and deem his theological perspective as promoting a “God who creates disposable people without any hope.”⁵⁹ But as Marilynne Robinson, points out, Calvin humanist admiration of humanity would say otherwise:

He’s terrifically admiring of what the human mind does. He says we have completely fallen away from the glory of God, and look what we are, and then he describes this glorious creature. The implication is that if we were to be in our un-fallen condition we would be spectacular.⁶⁰

Though Calvin shared a humanist admiration of humanity with Zwingli, he did not share his salvific language or theory of atonement. Instead, he used the legal language of Western Christianity, and firmly held to a strand of the satisfaction theory called *penal substitution*. More than likely, he was partially drawn to this language and theory due to his legal background, and from them his pastoral vision presents sin is a crime of humanity, and Christ as a sacrificial victim who takes its rightful punishment upon

⁵⁹ Rachel Held Evans, “Why Calvinism Makes Me Cry,” September 14, 2009, <http://rachelheldevans.com/blog/calvinismmakesmecry> (accessed October 29, 2014).

⁶⁰ Sarah Pulliam Bailey, “Q&A: Marilynne Robinson on Guns, Gay Marriage and Calvinism,” Religion News, entry posted May 9, 2014, <http://www.religionnews.com/2014/05/09/qa-marilynne-robinson-guns-gay-marriage-calvinism/> (accessed May 9, 2014)

Himself.⁶¹ Also, unlike Zwingli, he does not reject original guilt, but fully agrees with Augustine that all people are guilty of Adam and Eve's transgression.

Though Calvin has a positive view of humanity, he tempers it with the belief that human beings have fallen from their original state of splendor at the Creation by willfully rebelling against God.⁶² In other words, human beings have become deformed through sin, and to get back to their original splendor, they must first receive the true knowledge of God and themselves. One means by which people receive this knowledge is through pastoral preaching of the Gospel, which also reveals their crimes against God and the atoning work of Christ, who takes their punishment upon Himself that they might be restored from deformity. This is why Calvin begins the *Institutes* by talking about the knowledge of God, the knowledge of ourselves and their mutual connection. Calvin writes:

Our wisdom, in so far as it ought to be deemed true and solid Wisdom, consists almost entirely of two parts: the knowledge of God and of ourselves. But as these are connected together by many ties, it is not easy to determine which of the two precedes and gives birth to the other.⁶³

Upon contemplating these two kinds of knowledge through the Gospel, Calvin believed that those touched by the Holy Spirit would come to faith in Christ, and be led to repentance.⁶⁴ Unlike Zwingli's pastoral vision, repentance in Calvin's vision is when those who come to faith turn from the easy path of sin to embark upon the difficult

⁶¹ Beilby and Eddy, 68

⁶² John Calvin, 435

⁶³ Calvin, 47

⁶⁴ Calvin, 43

pilgrimage of the Christian life. Since believers will constantly struggle with the temptation of turning back and failures in moving forward, then repentance is a life-long discipline that must be encouraged. Along with the parishioners, the pastor is also a pilgrim whose main job is to give them comfort, admonishment and (most importantly) hope as they face trials and temptations.⁶⁵ Yet even more than this, pastors must also be aware of their own piety that they might be effective and help those under their watch reach their final destination. In Calvin's pastoral vision, the pastor's main goal is getting believers to heaven, where they are fully restored from the damage of sin and find eternal shalom in the presence of God.

Two Visions Made One: Zwingli and Calvin Together

Contrary to how those such as Held Evans' view Calvin's perspective, he is not presenting a God that leaves people in hopelessness. Instead, he is attempting to encourage believers with the joys of heaven that they might find hope in the love of a sovereign God amidst the struggles of life on earth. Furthermore, his doctrine of election is not a cold fatalism or lack of love for the non-elect; for Calvin, it is also a means of giving hope to those on the difficult pilgrimage of the Christian life.⁶⁶ But sadly, despite his good intentions, Calvin's attempts to bring hope can be (as reactions like those of Held Evan's show) eclipsed by his theory of atonement and salvific language. For many contemporary people, the notion of a loving God killing His only Son to satisfy an insatiable rage is illogical and cruel, and the traditional language of guilt/innocence and

⁶⁵ Calvin, 572

⁶⁶ Wright, 12

punishment/reward is unfit for addressing modern situations of suffering.⁶⁷ As Dorothy Sayers writes in *Strong Meat*, upon hearing someone ask about the atonement, Christians who promote Calvin's theory and language might as well answer, "God wanted to damn everybody, but His vindictive sadism was sated by the crucifixion of his own Son, who was quite innocent, and therefore, a particularly attractive victim."⁶⁸

Though one can respond to Sayers' skeptical sarcasm by saying that "God is love" and "gave his Son out of love," how is this reconciled with the almost sadistic appearance of penal substitution? And furthermore, how can one fathom talking about punishment and reward to innocent people suffering at the hands of wicked regimes (e.g., the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria)? For contemporary people Calvin's language and theory can be off-putting, and when lived out in the Reformed pastorate they can lead to actions that push people away from the Church and religion altogether. But worst of all, these things can lead Christians to wrongly believe that they are absolved from any responsibility in engaging with and seeking resolutions for the sufferings of others. While addressing the negative issues surrounding Anselmic soteriology, Douglas Hall writes:

The sources of evil and suffering, it [penal substitution] finds, are not so readily located outside the human will and psyche; therefore the question that it sets out to resolve is how God could forgive and remedy sin without destroying the sinner. Again however, the theory opts for a response which virtually eliminated humanity from the scene of resolution: God the Father accepts the "substitutionary" sacrifice of God the Son in lieu of guilt incurred by sinful humanity, we then become inheritors of the "benefits of His passion."⁶⁹

⁶⁷ Beilby and Eddy, 68

⁶⁸ Dorothy L. Sayers, *Strong Meat*, Part II: The Dogma Is Drama

⁶⁹ Douglas Hall, *God and Human Suffering: An Exercise in the Theology of the Cross*,

In citing those such as Hall, the researcher is not calling for a complete rejection of the theory and language behind Calvin's pastoral vision. In truth, one can see glimpses of penal substitution and legal language within Scripture, and together they have positively impacted the lives of Christians throughout the centuries. Nevertheless, in our modern age filled with suffering, much of society is not looking to simply be guiltless, or rewarded in heaven for good behavior on earth. In the modern context, people are looking to be healed and, in the words of James Forbes of the Riverside Church, "become instruments of healing on earth, spiritual and medical, for a healing God."⁷⁰ Nevertheless, as people desire to receive and give healing from God, they must always be reminded that the life of a healer is not an easy road, but a difficult journey that leads to a glorious destination. They must be reminded that being a healer also means being a pilgrim, who not only works for restoration or shalom on earth, but also seeks ultimate restoration in heaven.

Conclusion: A Case for Zwingli

For Reformed groups like the FVM, there is a shared pastoral concern that modern Western society is turning from Christianity due to a low view of the Church.⁷¹ This low view is also shared by non-Reformed thinkers such as Rob Bell, who argues that the cause of it is an "evacuation theology" which leads Christians to focus on getting to heaven, instead of God's healing work to renew and restore the world:

⁷⁰ James A. Forbes "The Healing Hands of My Father" (video). Sermon, The Riverside Church, New York, New York, June 19, 2014. Accessed October 14, 2014. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y6JtO5tW4-o>.

⁷¹ Alan D. Strange, "Understanding the Federal Vision." Orthodox Presbyterian Church http://www.opc.org/nh.html?article_id=478 (accessed October 14, 2014)

It often appears that those who talk the most about going to heaven when you die talk the least about bringing heaven to earth right now, as Jesus taught us to pray: “Your will be done on earth as it is in heaven.” At the same time, it often appears that those who talk the most about relieving suffering now talk the least about heaven when we die....If you believe that you’re going to leave and evacuate to somewhere else, then why do anything about this world?⁷²

Though much of the classic Reformed world (including some Reformed Baptist groups) does not hold to an evacuation theology, there is the danger that Calvin’s pastoral vision of pilgrimage can be wrongly seen as focused on getting people to heaven and ignoring God’s desire to heal the world. Also, though there have been Calvinistic movements that call for cultural engagement and societal transformation, they are often steeped in the salvific language and atonement theories of Western Christianity that many contemporary people find off-putting. In the case of those who leave the Reformed tradition in search of a Christianity with less legal language and alternative theories of atonement, a significant number have converted to Eastern Orthodoxy.⁷³ Apart from its history and rich liturgical heritage, part of Orthodoxy’s appeal is its medical language for salvation, ancestral view of Adam’s sin where guilt is not passed on, and recapitulation theories of atonement that emphasize Christ becoming human to heal and transform humanity.⁷⁴

For those going to the Eastern Church, it is Orthodoxy’s healing/transformational emphasis and nature that gives them a high view of the Church, and for Reformed thinkers concerned about a low view of the Church in Western society, Zwingli has much

⁷² Rob Bell, *Love Wins*, 45-46

⁷³ Jack D. Kinneer. “A Calvinist Looks at Orthodoxy.” Orthodox Presbyterian Church http://www.opc.org/new_horizons/calvinist_on_orthodoxy.html (accessed October 1, 2014)

⁷⁴ Trevin Wax, “Theron’s Story: Why I Left Evangelicalism for Eastern Orthodoxy,” The Gospel Coalition, entry posted November 8, 2006, <http://www.thegospelcoalition.org/blogs/trevinwax/2006/11/08/therons-story-why-i-left-evangelicalism-for-eastern-orthodoxy/> (accessed October 1, 2014).

to offer. In the Zürich Reformer, one will find much of what makes Orthodoxy appealing, save the rich liturgical heritage. They will find a Western theologian with an almost Eastern pastoral vision that lacks original guilt, is filled with medical language and presents a biblical Christ who does more than simply bear divine. Through Zwingli, one is presented with a Christ who comes to heal people broken by sin and bring them shalom. Above all, Zwingli presents a Christ that makes people healers through faith in action, and in this he opens the door to what many in modern society are longing for; to be instruments of healing that renew and restore the world.

Truly Zwingli has much to offer, but in addition to reversing a low view of the Church, he has much to offer in regard to the Reformed pastorate. If Reformed thinkers better acknowledged Zwingli and made use of his insights, then his pastoral vision of renewal could enrich Reformed pastoral theology, which is currently dominated by Calvin's vision. If Zwingli were better acknowledged then his vision would be the foundation or starting points of Reformed pastoral thought, which first and foremost presents the pastor as a healer leading God's people in healing the world through faith in action motivated by love. Nevertheless, a vision of earthly renewal alone does not stress the eternal-scope of the Gospel, and needs the pilgrimage vision of Calvin. With Calvin's vision, pastors can remind parishioners that their works of healing on earth are all a part of a perilous journey that leads to a glorious end. As the church heals through faith that translates into action in this life, it embarks upon a glorious journey that leads to complete healing [shalom] in the life everlasting.

CHAPTER FOUR: PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND RESEARCH METHODS

Research Methodologies

The nature of the research employed in this project was qualitative, and made use of case study and grounded theory. Case study was the primary methodology used by the researcher, while grounded theory was the secondary methodology. By making use of case study, the researcher was better able to thoroughly sift through various sources pertaining to Zwingli, and determine what information was credible and accurate among primary and secondary data. The primary data was obtained from literature (e.g., books, articles and dissertations) by credible authors, while the secondary data was obtained through interviews and field notes. Also through case study the researcher was better able to put aside widely held misconceptions and get a clearer picture of Zwingli and his theology.

As for the secondary methodology, called grounded theory, J.W. Creswell defines it as the researcher exploring “in depth a program, an event, an activity, a process of one or more individuals.”¹ The goal of this methodology is to develop a theory that emerges from and is connected to the reality that it is developed to explain.² In this project the

¹ J.W. Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*, 15

² Williams, Carrie. “Research Methods.” *Journal of Business and Economic Research*, 5, no. 3 (March 2007) 65-72

researcher first explored the life and thought of Zwingli in depth and the causes and effects of the Swiss and Zürich Reformations. The researcher also explored the concerns expressed by Reformed groups, such as the FVM, in regard to Calvin's pastoral vision and the effects of a faulty sacramentality upon the Reformed pastorate. Through this process of exploration, the researcher concluded that in addressing the aforementioned concerns, Reformed thinkers should make use of the pastoral vision and sacramental views of Zwingli in a way that complements those of Calvin.

Apart from in-depth exploration, grounded theory is also the process of collecting and analyzing data and repeating it, in what is called the constant comparative method. In the constant comparative method the researcher analyzes data through open coding, axial coding and selective coding.³ The researcher first examines a source several times and creates tentative labels for chunks of data; this is called open coding. In the case of this project, the researcher went about open coding by repeatedly examining literature pertaining to Zwingli and using labels such as *organic* and *medical* to describe his theology. After ascribing these labels, the researcher went about axial coding, which is identifying the relationship between labels. One example of axial coding in this project was determining the relationship between the labels of organic and medical, which was *healing*. Upon finding healing as the relationship between these two labels, the researcher was able to proceed with selective coding and discover the core variable within all the data collected: *renewal*.

³ Tiffany Derville-Gallicano, "An Example on how to Perform Open Coding, Axial Coding and Selective Coding," The PR Post, entry posted July 22, 2013, <http://prpost.wordpress.com/2013/07/22/an-example-of-how-to-perform-open-coding-axial-coding-and-selective-coding/> (accessed November 19, 2014).

Participants and Data Collection

Since case study was the primary research methodology, the researcher was required to go about interviews in the process of collecting data. Those who were interviewed were pastors, theologians and students who are taking part in Zwingli research, familiar with the Reformer's theology and/or making use of his insights in various settings. Two of the participants were pastor-theologians, and this added a unique perspective where the academic and parochial worlds were bridged and informed each other. Along with helping the researcher in gathering data, those interviewed also helped in analyzing information and verifying credible sources and conclusions.

After collecting primary data, the researcher decided to conduct four interviews with participants from three leading roles in the Reformed tradition. These roles are theologian, pastor and ordinand, and they represent the academic and parochial sides of Reformed Church life.⁴ In the first two interviews, the researcher spoke with professors Willem Balke of the *Reformed Alliance of the Protestant Church of the Netherlands* and Peter Opitz of the *Institute for Swiss Reformation History*. While surveying literature for this project, the researcher learned that Balke and Opitz are among Europe's leading scholars in Calvin and Zwingli studies. Both professors are also ordained ministers in national Reformed churches, and have much experience with bridging the theoretical world of academics and the practical world of parish ministry. Along with offering important insights and sources, these pastor-theologians helped to critique the researcher's understanding and conclusions regarding the pastoral visions of Calvin and Zwingli.

⁴ John Calvin, *An Abridgement of the Institution of the Christian Religion*, trans. Christopher Fetherstone, 234-237

Though the first two participants were ordained ministers, their perspectives were not strictly pastoral; therefore, the third participant was a Reformed pastor who had solely worked in parish ministry. For the third interview the researcher met with Richard Davis who is a Presbyterian minister and has lived in Switzerland for 16 years. Davis is also a former senior pastor of the IPC community, and during his time in Zürich he was a member of the international *Zwingli Club*, which works to spread awareness about the Swiss Reformation. Apart from implementing the Reformer's thought into his pastoral work, Davis has organized numerous Reformation tours of Zürich and published a booklet titled, *How Zürich Changed the World*. He also has an extensive knowledge of the life and thought of John Calvin, and assisted the researcher in further understanding his pastoral vision and its implications.

During the fourth and final interview, the researcher spoke with a theology student named Desiree Dippenaar who attends the University of Zürich and is an ordinand in the Swiss Reformed Church. As the researcher sought to understand ordination within the Zürich tradition, Dippenaar identified the Zwinglian elements of her pastoral training. She also critiqued the researcher's conclusions regarding Zwingli and his thought from a student's perspective, and exposed the researcher to more credible sources. Dippenaar has also been a missionary to Asia and Africa, and her international insights helped to give a clearer picture of Zwingli awareness in Reformed Churches of the global East and South.

Besides sharing their unique perspectives on Zwingli and analyzing data, the four participants helped the researcher in understanding the Reformer's sacramental views. In the initial phase of collecting data, it was found that conflicting opinions among credible

scholars made it difficult to study Zwingli's sacramentality independently. The researcher also observed that some scholarly opinions were based on possible misconceptions (e.g., Gregory Dix).⁵ Therefore, it was decided to explore Zwingli's sacramentality, its relationship to Calvin's sacramentality and its current use in Reformed Churches during the interviews. Unlike many scholars, who only encounter Zwingli's views through literature, those interviewed have encountered them in the Swiss context and the Reformed Church of Zürich.

A Case for Using LET

During interviews and lectures, the researcher was advised to better understand Zwingli's context in order to know his philosophy of ministry and the dynamics that shaped it. To do this, the researcher made use of the tools of case study through biographies and 16th century records from the Zürich city archives. From these tools, the researcher had a better understanding of Zwingli's context and pastoral work. But to find the Reformer's philosophy of ministry, the researcher made use of LET, which enabled them to see the dynamics that shaped it. Like the qualitative method, LET is an approach to research that focuses on the leadership development process instead of its outcome.⁶ In focusing on this process, LET requires the identification of developmental phases and

⁵ Thomas R. Schreiner and Matthew R. Crawford, *The Lord's Supper*, pg. 244 – Schreiner and Crawford make note of how Dix misrepresents Zwingli's sacramental views in, *The Shape of Liturgy* (pg. 633). Alister McGrath also makes note of Dix's misconceptions of Zwingli and his thought in, "The Eucharist: Reassessing Zwingli," *Theology* (Jan-Feb 1990), 14.

⁶ Anita G. Stadler, *Leadership Development by Divine Design: An Exploration of Christian Leadership Emergence Theory in the Corporate Context*, 115

processing items (situations or incidents that shape an individual), and the coding of data.⁷

Since case study was the primary research methodology for this project, a separate LET case study on Zwingli was not needed. Instead, the researcher identified the Reformer's developmental phases and processing items through relevant literature and interviews, and coded the data collected through grounded theory. Also during the researcher's first interviews, Balke and Opitz cautioned against overusing LET when seeking to find Zwingli's philosophy of ministry. To avoid this possible problem, the researcher looked to J. Robert Clinton's (the founder of LET) basic list of ministry philosophy models in *Leadership Emergence Theory: A Self-Study Manual for Analyzing the Development of a Christian Leader*. Upon looking to this list, the researcher found that the "Shepherd Leader" model was the most accurate for Zwingli's philosophy.⁸ Clinton's list also provided more categories and labels for the process of coding data.

In the final phase of the project, the researcher gathered all the data collected and sifted through it to find the Zürich Reformer's pastoral vision. Upon finding what appeared to be the correct vision, the researcher presented it to Balke and Opitz who critiqued and verified its authenticity. The pastor-theologians also verified what the researcher believed to be Calvin's pastoral vision, and assisted in the process of comparing and contrasting it with the vision of Zwingli. While comparing and contrasting the Reformers' visions, the theologians also helped the researcher to find two

⁷ Stadler, 61

⁸ J. Robert Clinton, *Leadership Emergence Theory*, 63

central themes that expressed their essence; these themes were “pilgrimage” and “renewal.”

Since the issue the researcher sought to address entailed a faulty sacramentality, they also sought to understand the sacramental views of Calvin and Zwingli in the final phase of the project. After collecting data on each Reformer’s sacramentality through literature, interviews and lectures, the researcher had brief follow-up discussions with Balke and Opitz. During these discussions they helped in further separating factual and invalid data, and showed the researcher how and where the central themes were present in the sacramental views of Calvin and Zwingli. As the researcher explored the Reformers’ sacramental views, they then explored the FVM’s concern regarding a faulty sacramentality based upon an improper adherence to Calvin’s pastoral vision.

Following the second series of discussions, the researcher used the verified data from the studies of Zwingli’s pastoral vision and sacramentality to formulate a prototypical template of pastoral ministry. Upon formulating this template, the Researcher compared and contrasted it with the dominant Calvinistic template and looked at ways in which one could complement the other. In the process of creating the new template, the researcher presented it to the four interview participants, who critiqued the researcher’s conclusions as to how it might complement the Calvinistic template. They also helped with finding practical ways in which the new template could be tested. In light of the FVM’s concern, the most practical way was the sacramental life of a congregation.

Interview Data Analysis

As was shown in chapter four, the method of analysis used was the constant comparative method, where the researcher codes data until a central theme or core variable is found. After coding the data from Zwinglian sources and identifying “renewal” as the core variable, the researcher drafted a questionnaire for the four participants who were interviewed. Along with six questions that focused on Zwingli and his theology, the questionnaire also presented the project’s thesis problem and proposed solution. Participants were asked to study the questions in preparation to being interviewed, and to write down questions that might help the researcher in further analyzing data.

In each interview, the proposed solution to the thesis problem was critiqued, and this was the first step in what Barney Glaser and Anselm Strauss call “generating a credible theory.” According to Glaser and Strauss, generating theory is a continuously growing process where a “draft theory” is refined through a series of critiques or “stages.”⁹ During each stage, data is further analyzed with the end result being a credible theory based upon factual information that has been reviewed and verified. Also, as data is analyzed the researcher’s assumptions or conclusions are tested to see if they are valid.

In the case of this project, each interview was a stage in a series of critiques that resulted in a credible theory for addressing the researcher’s thesis problem. As Glaser and Strauss point out, each stage of critique grew into its subsequent stage as participants

⁹ Barney G. Glaser and Anselm L. Strauss, *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*, 105

assisted the researcher in further analyzing data.¹⁰ Nevertheless, as the researcher's draft theory [the proposed solution to the thesis problem] was refined through each stage, earlier stages remained in operation. In other words, the critiques of later interviews were informed by critiques from earlier interviews.

¹⁰ Glaser and Strauss, 105

CHAPTER FIVE: RESEARCH AND DATA ANALYSIS

In the process of collecting and analyzing data, the researcher followed the research plan of Maria de Hoyos and Sally-Anne Barnes who state that one must start to analyze data from day one. According to Hoyos and Barnes, “all is data,” therefore one should not wait until conducting interviews to begin collecting and analyzing data.¹ Long before conducting interviews the researcher must look to complementary sources of data (e.g., books, articles and records), including data from other researchers (e.g., surveys), that pertains to the subject being explored. Though the process of collection and analysis could begin with interviews, starting with complementary sources can produce new questions to ask participants. Also, starting with complementary sources can suggest what to focus on during an interview and reveal which constants are relevant.

Stages of Critique: Theologians, Pastors and Ordinands

While analyzing data from complementary sources, the researcher was able to draft a list of six questions that structured interviews by keeping them focused on Zwingli, his sacramentality and the current awareness and use of his theological perspective. The questions were:

1. Is there are need for more awareness of Zwingli and his theological perspective in non-Swiss Reformed churches [churches outside of Switzerland]?

¹ Maria De Hoyos and Sally-Anne Barnes. “Analyzing Interview Data.” Lecture, Core Training Modules, Warwick, February 15, 2012.

2. On a scale of 1 to 10 (1 being very low and 10 being very high), how is Zwingli's influence among non-Swiss Reformed churches?

3. In the process of collecting data the researcher has found that John Calvin is often wrongly seen as the father of the Reformed tradition and greater than Zwingli. Why is this?

4. Are Zwingli's sacramental views properly understood within Reformed churches in and outside of Switzerland?

5. Though many non-sacramental Churches (Baptists, Pentecostals, Anabaptist, etc.) claim to be "Zwinglian" in their views of the Lord's Table, the researcher thinks otherwise. The researcher believes that such churches hold to a misunderstanding of Zwingli's views where the real presence of Christ is denied. Is this assessment correct or incorrect?

6. Certain Reformed movements (e.g., The Federal Vision Movement) hold that a misunderstanding and misuse of John Calvin's sacramentality (where the believers are received by Christ through the Holy Spirit) has made Reformed pastors less effective in getting believers to put faith into action. The researcher proposes that instead of revising Calvin, a better solution to this concern is balancing Calvin's sacramentality with that of Zwingli (where believers are compelled to imitate "Christ their Captain" who embraced the world with service and love). What do you think of the aforementioned concern and the researcher's solution? Does the researcher understand the essence of Zwingli's sacramentality, and is their solution valid or invalid?

In addition to the six questions, participants were asked to look over the researcher's thesis problem and proposed solution in preparation of being interviewed.

Each participant represented one of three leading roles in the Reformed tradition: theologians, pastors and ordinands.

Stage One: Willem Balke

For the first interview, the researcher travelled to the Netherlands to meet with Willem Balke, a well-known Reformed pastor-theologian and historian. Balke is an ordained minister in the Protestant Church in the Netherlands and emeritus professor of church history at the Free University of Amsterdam. Throughout his career he has taken part in various research projects within Calvin studies, and has published several books aimed at exposing the Reformer's true perspective amidst contemporary misconceptions. Balke is also one of the leading Zwingli scholars of Europe, and has done much work regarding the Zürich Reformers sacramental views. Over the course of three days, the researcher interviewed the pastor-theologian at his home in Den Haag, and gained many insights on the life and thought of Zwingli.

Balke Interview

Question 1 - Throughout his years of teaching and ministry, Balke has noticed that the knowledge of Zwingli among Reformed churches is often rooted in widespread misconceptions. The pastor theologian has also noticed that these misconceptions are found within Swiss Churches, where Zwingli is acknowledged but seen as an embarrassment. In Balke's opinion the most common misconception of the Reformer is that he was a murderer due to the persecution of the Anabaptists. But, in citing G.R. Potter's biography of Zwingli, Balke stated that though the Reformer supported the Zürich government's reaction to radical Anabaptists, he was far from a murderer. Potter writes that some Zürich Anabaptist leaders resorted to violence, and in response the

Zürich city council doled out harsh punishments that led to the deaths of innocent people.²

Nevertheless, in citing Potter, Balke was not defending the harsh actions of the Zürich council or Zwingli who supported them. Instead he was showing the researcher an area where the Reformer needs to be properly understood within his 16th century context. Because Zwingli is depicted as a murderer, Balke stated that this has made him less appealing and kept his thought out of Reformed discourse. Therefore, Balke concluded that there is truly a need for more awareness of the Reformer and his theological perspective in Reformed Churches in and outside of Switzerland.

Question 2 - In response to question two, Balke asked in which sense the researcher was using the word “influence.” For Balke, Zwingli has influenced Reformed churches in two ways: visible and hidden. In regard to Zwingli’s visible influence, the pastor-theologian cited things such as the basic tenants of the Reformed tradition (e.g., the centrality of the Holy Scriptures). And as for the Reformer’s hidden influence Balke cited things such as Reformed liturgical practices (e.g., communion tables instead of altars). In ranking Zwingli’s influence among Reformed Churches, the pastor-theologian ranked the Reformer’s visible influence at 8, and his hidden influence at 2 to 3.

Question 3 - Balke stated that, along with being viewed as a murderer, Zwingli is also viewed as a nationalistic liberal who twisted Scripture for selfish purposes. Balke added that the Reformer was deeply patriotic, and this in turn led him to take up arms and lose his life at Kappel. The pastor-theologian went on to say that in a Europe still haunted

² Potter, 191

by the memories of nationalistic wars, the Reformer's patriotic flare can be very off-putting and narrow-minded to a modern multi-cultural Europe that values globalization. But as for Calvin, Balke stated that the Geneva Reformer's soft patriotism makes him more appealing and acceptable to modern Europe.

Due to Calvin's wider audience and emphasis on the Gospel's universal concerns, Balke believes that his writings were more graspable and easier to circulate among non-Swiss people. Furthermore, Balke stated that Calvin had a very detailed and logical mind, which made his use of Scripture appear more consistent and trustworthy than that of Zwingli. Nevertheless, despite Calvin's detail and mind, Balke stated that it was a wide circulation of the Geneva Reformer's writings that ultimately gave the impression that he was the founder of the Reformed faith. According to Balke this impression of Calvin remains in the modern era, and this is why Calvinism is commonly used as a synonym for Reformed theology.

Question 4 - Like the late G.W. Bromiley, whom he worked with for many years and cited during the interview, Balke thinks that Zwingli's sacramentality is highly misunderstood.³ While citing Bromiley's book *Zwingli and Bullinger*, Balke stated that this misunderstanding stems from Reformed thinkers deeming Zwingli's view of the real presence of Christ as "bare memorialism." Bromiley writes that the Zürich Reformer had no wish to deny Christ's presence in the Eucharist altogether, and that the sacrament

³ Bromiley, 179

cannot merely be a “commemorative rite” when Jesus is present and active among His people through His Word.⁴

As Balke concluded his answer to the fourth question, he told the researcher that since Calvin’s sacramentality is the standard view of Reformed churches, then most Reformed pastors in training hear little to nothing of Zwingli. But in cases where the Zürich Reformer’s sacramentality is discussed, Balke stated that it is often misrepresented and leads to misconceptions that are spread through classrooms and pulpits.

Question 5 - Contrary to the researcher’s opinion, Balke held that non-sacramental churches adhere to Zwingli’s earlier views of the Eucharist. According to the pastor-theologian, Zwingli denied the real presence in his earlier views to refute Luther’s consubstantiation. Balke then added that overtime the Zürich Reformer was more inclined to stress the real presence in the Eucharist, but his earlier views had already been adopted by groups like the Anabaptists. While discussing Zwingli’s shift regarding the real presence, Balke cautioned the researcher to distinguish between the Reformer’s earlier views and later views.

Question 6 - Overall Balke agreed with the proposed solution to the thesis problem, but he encouraged the researcher to get a better understanding of how Zwingli’s views relate to those of Calvin. Though the researcher had a correct understanding of Calvin’s sacramentality, Balke sensed a lack of awareness of how Zwingli had influenced it. The pastor-theologian also felt that the researcher’s data showed a lack of awareness

⁴ Bromiley, 179

regarding Zwingli's influence on Calvin in general. At the close of the interview, Balke encouraged the researcher to answer the question of how Zwingli views influence and relate to those of his contemporary. By answering this question Balke believed that the researcher would have a better understanding of how the Reformers' perspectives might work together and complement each other.

Stage Two: Peter Opitz

For the second interview, the researcher met with pastor-theologian Peter Opitz of the University of Zürich's Institute for Swiss Reformation History. Opitz is an ordained minister in the Swiss Reformed Church and a professor of ecclesiastical and doctrinal history of the Reformation. As a historian, much of Opitz's work focuses on the development of Reformed thought from the Reformation era to the present and how the Zürich tradition has influenced the Geneva tradition. Like Balke, Opitz is a leading scholar in Zwingli studies, and has done much research pertaining to the Zürich Reformer's sacramentality and how it relates to that of Calvin's. During his three hour interview, the pastor-theologian gave the researcher a greater understanding of Zwingli's perspective on Eucharistic grace and how it is given to communicants.

Opitz Interview

Question 1 - Like Balke, whom he has worked with on several research projects, Opitz believed that there is a need for more awareness of Zwingli among Reformed churches. Though Opitz saw much of this need as emerging in light of widespread misunderstandings, he stated that it also comes in light of a growing interest in the Zürich Reformer. One example of this growing interest that Opitz pointed out can be seen in the

work of Jim West, who is Professor of Biblical Studies at the Quartz Hill School of Theology. Since 2010 West has operated a blog called *Zwingli Redivivus*, which features the letters and treatises of Zwingli and Bullinger. This blog also features entries where Zwingli's thoughts are engaged by contributors, and readers are exposed to a wide range of resources pertaining to the Zürich tradition. According to Opitz, West's efforts in spreading Zwingli awareness have greatly increased a growing interest in the Reformer in the United States.

Question 2 - Though Opitz gave Zwingli's influence a 10, he stated that Swiss and non-Swiss Reformed pastors and parishioners are often unaware of it. From his pastoral work in Swiss Reformed parishes, Opitz has found that much of Zwingli's influence has become ecclesiastical norms that few care to inquire about. As for Reformed churches outside of Switzerland, Opitz thought that Zwingli's influence is often attributed to Calvin. Furthermore, the pastor-theologian believed that the Zürich Reformer's influence is hidden due to his unwarranted reputation as a warmonger and denier of the real presence. Nevertheless, though hidden, Opitz stated that Zwingli's influence is quite strong among Reformed Churches, and evidence of this can be seen in the use of tables instead of altars for the Eucharist.

Question 3 - Along with agreeing with Balke, Opitz revealed that Calvin overshadows Zwingli because of his ecclesiology. According to Opitz, the Geneva Reformer did not have the full support of his city council, and was seeking to establish churches in contexts of persecution. The pastor-theologian went on to say that from his experience as a refugee and exile, Calvin created a church structure that allowed

Christians to establish and govern congregations without State support. One example of Calvin's ecclesiology that Opitz showed the researcher was from Karen Spierling's, *Infant Baptism in Reformation Geneva*. In chapter one Spierling tells the story of a Reformed congregation in Paris who elected one of their members as minister to avoid an infant being baptized in the Roman rite.⁵

After citing Spierling's example of Calvin's ecclesiology, Opitz stated that the Geneva Reformer also overshadows Zwingli due to his own criticisms of the Zürich Reformer. While looking over the researcher's data from surveying literature, Opitz verified that David Steinmetz's conclusions on Calvin's negative opinion of Zwingli were correct.⁶ Though Zwingli influenced Calvin, Opitz stated that the Geneva Reformer's inability to read German led to an inability to understand his predecessor's full views. In concluding his answer to question three, Opitz told the researcher that Calvin's understanding of Zwingli's theology was limited to the Zürich Reformer's Latin works, which expressed views that later shifted.

Question 4 - Like Balke, Opitz stated that Zwingli's sacramental views are highly misunderstood due to a lack of distinguishing between his earlier and later perspectives. According to Opitz, Zwingli was a "reactionary theological pioneer," which resulted in a constant shifting of his views from changes in his context. In citing the *Commentary on True and False Religion*, where Zwingli sought to refute Luther's consubstantiation, Opitz showed the researcher how contextual shifts changed Zwingli's sacramentality. In

⁵ Karen E. Spierling, *Infant Baptism in Reformation Geneva: The Shaping of a Community*, 1-2

⁶ Steinmetz, 172-173

the *Commentary*, the Reformer closely aligns baptism with the Old Swiss Confederation, and compares it to declaring oneself a Swiss confederate.⁷ But when the Anabaptists later carry this view to its full conclusion and abolish infant baptism, Zwingli responds by looking for a biblical/logical defense of the practice and thus changes his position.

Question 5 - After showing the researcher the importance of distinguishing between Zwingli's earlier and later views, Opitz agreed with Balke's answer to question five. Though non-sacramental churches could claim to be "Zwinglian" in their views of the sacrament, Opitz stated that they are adhering to the Reformer's earlier views. According to Opitz, Zwingli first taught that the Eucharist was merely a human response to God, but he later came to see it as entailing a gesture from God to humanity. In his later views, as Opitz pointed out, the Reformer held that God spiritually gives something to believers through the words of Jesus spoken over the elements. Opitz went on to say that evidence of this shift in Zwingli's sacramentality can be seen in his adoption of the Anabaptist practice of gathering around the table.⁸ The later Zwingli viewed the words of institution as Jesus inviting communicants to join Him at the table to share the bread and cup with Him.

In regard to the real presence, Opitz stated that the main difference between the later Zwingli and non-sacramental traditions is an emphasis on where this presence is. Though non-sacramental churches would agree that Christ is not present in the elements, they (in Opitz's opinion) place less emphasis on His presence in the event of the Eucharist. Since many non-sacramental traditions have roots in American revivalism,

⁷ Zwingli, 179

⁸ Potter, 183-184

Opitz believed that they place more emphasis on the real presence in the event of preaching. But in citing Zwingli's belief that Christ is present whenever the Word of God is proclaimed, Opitz showed the researcher that unlike non-sacramental churches the Reformer did not deny the real presence in the Eucharist.

Question 6 - Though Opitz saw the thesis problem and proposed solution as valid, he took issue with the researcher's understanding of Calvin's sacramentality. The researcher had assumed that Calvin's vision of pilgrimage deemphasized faith in action in his Eucharistic views, but Opitz stated otherwise. In citing Herman Selderhuis, Opitz stated that faith in action is less emphasized in Calvin's Eucharistic views because he focused on ending Luther and Zwingli's debate over the real presence.⁹ Furthermore, the pastor-theologian told the researcher that Calvin's Eucharistic views emphasize the holiness of the sacrament, the communicant as recipient and preparing the communicant to properly receive God's grace.

Opitz went on to say that though Calvin's use of a table comes from Zwingli, he parts ways with the Zürich Reformer in regard to how God responds to His people. Instead of seeing the Eucharist as a human response to divine works, the pastor-theologian stated that Calvin saw it as God's response to the worship offered by His people. As worshippers went about adoration, confession, thanksgiving and supplication, the Reformer believed that God would respond through the sacrament where Christ embraces the faithful and gives His grace. But if misunderstood, Calvin's view of the Eucharist as God's response could lead to what Opitz called a "concave spirituality". In

⁹ Selderhuis, *John Calvin: A Pilgrim's Life*, 94

concave spirituality communicants become passive recipients, and the grace they receive goes unshared with the world. Nevertheless, Zwingli's earlier view of the Eucharist as a human response could lead to what Opitz called "convex spirituality". In convex spirituality communicants are only active followers who receive no grace while observing the sacraments.

At the close of the interview, Opitz advised the researcher to focus on balancing the concave and convex natures of Calvin and Zwingli's Eucharistic views. For the pastor-theologian, a good sacramentality is both convex and concave, and makes communicants both recipients and givers who actively receive and share God's grace. Opitz also reminded the researcher to look to Zwingli's later views, where believers receive something from God while the sacraments remain a human response. Furthermore, he suggested that the researcher look deeper into how sacramentality relates to and affects pastoral vision.

Stage Three: Richard Davis

For the third interview, the researcher met with Richard Davis, who is the former senior pastor of IPC Zürich. Davis is an ordained minister in the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), and he currently resides in southern Switzerland. Throughout his career he has worked to help parishioners understand the significance and impact of the Reformed faith apart from the context of Sunday services. Unlike Balke and Opitz, whose main aim is making Zwingli relevant in the academic life, Davis' main aim is to make the Reformer relevant in parochial life. One way in which he has shown Zwingli's relevance to parishioners is his book, *How Zürich Changed the World*. Apart from showing how many modern Western values can be traced back to the Zürich Reformer, Davis' book enables

the reader to take a self-guided tour of sacred and secular sites that are significant to the Zürich Reformation. While being interviewed, Davis helped the researcher to further discern the relevance of the thesis problem in parochial life and how to make parishioners take part in solving it.

Davis Interview

Question 1 - In terms of a “felt need” for more awareness of Zwingli and his theological perspective, Davis stated that he has not perceived it among Reformed Churches in and outside of Switzerland. Nevertheless, Davis felt that there is a normative need for Zwingli awareness due to widely held misconceptions, which Balke and Opitz made mention of (e.g., Zwingli was a murdering warmonger). The pastor also stated that while serving as IPC Zürich’s senior minister, he noticed that many native-Swiss had little to no knowledge of Zwingli and his contributions to Western civilization. In citing his book *How Zürich Changed the World*, Davis showed the researcher that many modern Western values (e.g., social welfare, public education, pride in workmanship etc.) can be partly attributed to the Zürich Reformer.¹⁰ Therefore, despite the lack of a felt need for more awareness of Zwingli, the pastor felt that there is a normative need.

Question 2 - Davis highlighted the same hidden historical influences of Zwingli that Balke and Opitz identified earlier (e.g., a communion table instead of an altar). He gave the Reformer’s hidden influence an 8 or 9.

Question 3 - Davis listed four reasons for Calvin being seen as the father of the Reformed tradition: 1) Calvin was living and working in Geneva, which was a greater

¹⁰ Davis, 5

center of influence, education and commerce than Zurich. 2) Calvin was trained as a lawyer and academic thinker, whereas Zwingli was trained as a priest and was a pastor at heart. 3) Calvin's influence among his colleagues in the Reformed movement extended further than Zwingli's. The Geneva Reformer was in close communion with many throughout Europe and the UK. 4) Calvin mentored John Knox who took the Geneva Reformer's ecclesiology to Scotland, established the Presbyterian Church and enabled the Reformed faith to be established in the New World.

After hearing Davis' mention of Calvin's legal training, the researcher told the pastor of how they assessed that Zwingli was a "shepherd pastor" in light of the Reformer's pastoral vision and Calvin seeing himself as a "watch-dog pastor". The pastor agreed with the researcher's assessment and stated that in Church life Calvin sought to maintain order like a dog that watches sheep, while Zwingli sought to establish order like a shepherd herding sheep. Davis also added that, unlike his urban contemporary, the Zürich Reformer was born into a family of herdsmen and worked with Alpine shepherds as a child.¹¹ Therefore, the pastor concluded that much of Zwingli's pastoral theology, expressed in sermons like *Der Hirt (The Shepherd)*, emerge from his native Alpine context.

Despite giving Zwingli a unique view of ministry, Davis stated that the Reformer's shepherding background could not enable him to maintain the Reformation he sparked. Nevertheless, the pastor believed that Calvin's experience as a lawyer gave him the tools, skills and logical mind to maintain the Swiss Reformation. According to Davis, Calvin's training gave him the discipline to write his *Institutes*, which had a

¹¹ D'Aubigné, 2-3

profound influence on the spread of the Swiss Reformation. In Davis' opinion, the doctrinal content and detailed church orders of Calvin's *Institutes* helped to firmly establish the Reformed tradition, and thus gave the impression that the Geneva Reformer had founded it.

Question 4 - Though Davis felt at a disadvantage in answering this question, he told the researcher that he sensed a general misunderstanding among Reformed churches regarding the Eucharist and the meaning behind its elements. In the pastor's opinion, the specifics of both Calvin and Zwingli's sacramentalities are unknown to most Reformed parishioners, and Reformed pastors bear much of the blame. Davis stated that, despite their theological training, many Reformed pastors do not have a clear understanding of the Eucharist, and this has led to the sacrament being deemphasized. In regard to the real presence, Davis told the researcher that Western Christians (Protestant and Catholic) have reduced the real presence to two views: transubstantiation and Zwingli's earlier memorialism. The pastor then stated that there are many other options to view the real presence, such as Zwingli's later spiritual presence, but they are rarely discussed and go unknown.

Question 5 - In seeking to avoid friction, factions and confusion, Davis believed that Reformed pastors have not encouraged critical thinking about the nature of the Eucharist. Though parishioners hear that Christ is "in some way present", they (in Davis' opinion) are never told how He is present and what His presence does. In regard to non-sacramental churches, the pastor agreed with Opitz that there is less emphasis on the real presence in the event of the Eucharist. Davis believed that the aforementioned low

emphasis in non-sacramental churches can be attributed to pastors seeking to avoid the same issues that Reformed pastors wish to avoid.

In concluding his answer to question five, Davis stated that a good starting point for educating parishioners is to explain the biblical context of the sacraments, and delineate the differences between a “sign” and a “symbol.” The pastor then added that if Reformed and non-Reformed communities explored the Eucharist in enlivening and enjoyable ways, then the sacramental experience of parishioners would be greatly enriched.

Question 6 - Though many clergy and theologically informed parishioners would understand the importance of the thesis problem, Davis felt that much of the Reformed laity would not. Because Reformed pastors have not stressed the purpose and importance of the sacraments, Davis felt that the average parishioner might see the thesis problem as a “tempest in a teapot.” In the process of refining the draft theory, the pastor encouraged the researcher to rethink how the thesis problem should be presented. By rethinking this presentation, the pastor believed the researcher could show the problem’s relevance to the daily life and faith of parishioners.

In addition to showing the problem’s relevance, Davis also encouraged the researcher to find relevant and unexpected mediums for presenting the problem and its solution. Throughout his career Davis had found that pastors often present new concepts through expected age-old media (e.g., sermon series, special classes etc.) where parishioners mostly listen and never engage with ideas. Instead of the typical special class in adult Sunday school, the pastor advised the researcher to be creative and think outside

of the box. Davis then concluded his answer to question six by suggesting that the researcher's medium of presentation be one that enables parishioners to take part in the teaching process.

Stage Four: Desiree Dippenaar

For the fourth and final interview, the researcher met with Desiree Dippenaar, a student of Opitz from the University of Zürich. In addition to her theological studies, Dippenaar is currently completing her final year of Vikariat where she is being trained for pastoral ministry in the Swiss Reformed Church. Though Dippenaar is a native of Switzerland, she has spent most of her life in Africa and Asia where her parents work as missionaries. She also attends IPC Zürich, and has assisted the researcher in giving the Eucharist at special services. Dippenaar also attended IPC when Davis served as the congregation's senior pastor, and she knows of Balke and has made use of his work in several projects. During her interview, Dippenaar shared her unique perspective of the Reformed faith in the global South and global East. From her insights, the researcher was able to get a better view of the state of Zwingli awareness in non-Western Reformed churches and seminaries.

Dippenaar Interview

Question 1 - While attending Presbyterian/Reformed Churches throughout Africa and Asia, Dippenaar noticed a strong knowledge of Calvin with little awareness of Zwingli. Dippenaar also noticed a lack of Zwingli awareness among students in African and Asian Reformed seminaries, and this led her to conclude that the Reformed is rarely mentioned in non-Western theological education. In light of these experiences, the

ordinand stated that there is truly a need for more awareness of Zwingli and his perspective in Reformed Churches outside of Switzerland. She also told the researcher that during her experience as a Swiss Reformed ordinand, she has observed a need for more Zwingli awareness in the Swiss Reformed Church itself. Like Balke, Opitz and Davis, Dippenaar spoke of the widespread misunderstandings regarding the Zürich Reformer, and his unwarranted reputation as a murderer.

Question 2 - Though she saw Zwingli's hidden influence as important, Dippenaar focused on his known influence among pastors and parishioners, which she gave a 3 to 4.

Question 3 - Like Davis, Dippenaar presented the researcher with a list of reasons as to why Zwingli was eclipsed by Calvin. The reasons are a mass immigration of persecuted Calvinists (e.g. Huguenots) from Catholic countries, Zwingli's early and the preference of Calvin's sacramentality among Reformed Christians, which led most Reformed churches to adopt the Geneva tradition.

Along with her lists of reasons, Dippenaar also agreed with the reasons listed by Balke, Opitz and Davis. In fact, being a student of Opitz, much of her knowledge of Zwingli had come from the pastor-theologian's courses and seminars.

Question 4 - Dippenaar stated that Zwingli's Eucharistic views are not just misunderstood, but unknown to most Reformed pastors and parishioners. During her ordination process, she was required to take a course on the Reformer's understanding of the Eucharist. But despite taking this course, Dippenaar stated that she and her classmates found themselves unsure of Zwingli's sacramentality due to issues pertaining to his earlier and later views. One issue that Dippenaar highlighted for the researcher was a

confusion over Zwingli's earlier views that cannot be classified as "kept" or "changed." Because of the Reformer's unclassified views and a constant changing of his perspective, the ordinand stated that some scholars believe that it is hard to define what Zwinglianism is.¹² Therefore, Dippenaar advised the researcher to be aware of Zwingli's unclassified views when drawing conclusions about his theology.

In concluding her answer to question four, Dippenaar informed the researcher that the Eucharist in Swiss Reformed Churches is very rare, and the practice of celebrating it once a month is often seen as "radical." In her experience as an ordinand, she had found that the Eucharist was not fully explained to pastors in training, which has a negative effect on those in the pews. Also, through conversations with church leaders and professors, Dippenaar discovered that many Swiss Reformed parishioners are uncertain about the Eucharist and know little about its meaning. There are even cases where the ordinand observed parishioners avoiding Sunday services where the Eucharist was celebrated because they were afraid of it.

According to Dippenaar, the aforementioned avoidance of the Eucharist stems from the fact that Swiss Reformed churches traditionally celebrate it four times a year. In other words, the sacrament is not a regular part of Swiss Reformed church life, and this has led to the creation of weekly Communion services to give it more importance. One such weekly service, which Dippenaar helps to lead, takes place at the Helferei Grossmünster (Zwingli's former office) and is open to the public.

¹² Ulrich Gäbler, *Huldrych Zwingli: His Life and Work*, 155-156

Question 5 - Following her course and personal studies on Zwingli's sacramentality, Dippenaar had come to agree with Opitz that non-sacramental Churches hold to Zwingli's earlier views. In these earlier views the bread and wine are just symbols to remind believers of Christ, and their sacramental meaning is denied. But in citing Opitz, Dippenaar stated that the Zürich Reformer acknowledged the real presence of Christ in his later views. Dippenaar also told the researcher that unlike Luther, who defined the real presence in a corporal or bodily sense, Zwingli strictly defined it in a spiritual sense. She then stated that the Zürich Reformer's main issue with Luther's consubstantiation was not the idea of Christ being present in the Eucharist, but the idea of His physical ascended body (which is in heaven) being present.

While showing how Zwingli defined the real presence in the Eucharist, Dippenaar also helped the researcher to explore the Reformer's emphasis regarding the real presence. Unlike Luther, who emphasized how Jesus is present in the Eucharist, Dippenaar stated that Zwingli emphasized what His presence does. In the Reformer's emphasis, the real spiritual presence of Jesus helps communicants to remember His work on earth and compels them to follow His example in all parts of life. Earlier on, the researcher had found a similar explanation of Zwingli's emphasis in the work of David Steinmetz. Steinmetz writes that the Reformer saw memory as a faculty that takes datum from the past and makes it a living part of the present.¹³ This faculty brings past lessons (e.g., how to tie a shoe) into the present through various mediums (e.g., shoe laces) to enable human beings to function.

¹³ Beverly R. Gaventa and Robert B. Hays, *Seeking the Identity of Jesus: A Pilgrimage*, 273

Upon seeing the researcher's data from Steinmetz, Dippenaar added that instead of the elements themselves, Zwingli saw the event of the Eucharist as a means or moment of grace. In this moment of grace the memory of Jesus in the past is brought into the present through the elements so that faithful communicants might follow His example. But according to Dippenaar, just like their Reformed counterparts, non-sacramental Churches are unaware of these important aspects of Zwingli's views. Thus the Reformer's sacramentality is often deemed as bare memorialism where nothing special takes place.

Question 6 - Though Dippenaar agreed that balancing the sacramentalities of Calvin and Zwingli was important, she also stressed the importance of rethinking liturgy. While looking over the researcher's proposed solution, the ordinand found no mention of liturgy and stated that church services are a way in which pastors lead and educate parishioners. According to Dippenaar, the sermon, benediction and specific prayers of most liturgies are areas where faith in action is encouraged, but in others areas it could be stressed more. By making faith in action a constant theme throughout the liturgy, Dippenaar felt that one benefit would be a balance between the convex and concave natures of Calvin and Zwingli's sacramentalities.

In concluding the interview, Dippenaar advised the researcher to make use of liturgical elements as a medium of teaching parishioners about the Eucharist and encouraging faith in action. One liturgical element that she suggested the researcher make use of was the time of introduction before celebrating the Eucharist. In Dippenaar's

opinion, the introduction is a time where parishioners are more focused and open to learning about the sacrament and its meaning.

Conclusions

Upon finishing the interviews, the researcher took each participant's critique and applied them to the proposed solution. In following Balke's advice, the researcher first did a study of Zwingli's influence on Calvin through literature and lectures at the University of Zürich's theological faculty. One lecture was given by Opitz at the *International Congress on Calvin Research*. During this lecture, Opitz showed how Zwingli influenced Calvin's reading of Scripture, views of the real presence and liturgical practices in celebrating the Eucharist. In completing the study of how the Zürich Reformer influenced his contemporary, the researcher found that Calvin's pastoral vision and sacramental views bore Zwinglian elements. Since the Geneva Reformer's vision and sacramentality contained Zwinglian elements, the researcher concluded that the Calvinistic template of pastoral ministry also bore Zwingli's influence.

After following Balke's advice, the researcher took up Opitz's suggestion and briefly explored the relationship between sacramentality and pastoral vision. While surveying literature on the subject, the researcher found that sacramentality is a part of one's pastoral identity and affects how his or her pastoral vision is lived out.¹⁴ In *Lord's Supper Practice in the Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition*, Huyser-Honig writes that a poor understanding of the Eucharist among Reformed clergy has resulted in a pastorate

¹⁴ Allan H. Cole, *From Midterms to Ministry*, 22

that fails to foster “Eucharistic piety.”¹⁵ This piety is a tradition harkening back to the ancient church that consists of the entire congregation giving thanks to God by offering Him their lives through works of righteousness. In other words, in response to God’s grace, communicants respond with faith in action. Upon taking up Opitz’s suggestion, the researcher concluded that a Zwinglian template had to make pastors see themselves in the Eucharistic context in a way that differed from the Calvinistic template. In the Calvinistic template (with its Zwinglian influences) the pastor gathers parishioners to receive grace in the Eucharistic context, but a Zwinglian template had to lead pastors to send parishioners out to share grace.

Upon exploring the relationship between sacramentality and pastoral vision, the researcher concluded that the proposed solution to the thesis problem was a Zwinglian template that fostered Eucharistic piety. In fostering this piety the solution had to stress the importance of pastors having a good sacramentality which, as Opitz pointed out, is both convex and concave in nature. Also, in light of Davis’ critique, the solution had to entail making Eucharistic piety relevant to parishioners through mediums that were unexpected and engaging. One such medium could be, as Dippenaar stated, a liturgy where faith in action was a constant theme.

¹⁵ Joan Huyser-Honig, “Lord’s Supper Practice in the Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition,” Calvin Institute of Christian Worship, entry posted July 24, 2007 <http://worship.calvin.edu/resources/resource-library/lord-s-supper-practice-in-the-reformed-and-presbyterian-tradition/> (accessed December 11, 2014).

CHAPTER SIX: EVALUATION AND CONCLUSIONS

A New Template

In the previous decade certain Reformed movements began to assert that an improper understanding of John Calvin's pastoral vision had resulted in a faulty sacramentality. According to these movements, this sacramentality has led Reformed pastors to unintentionally make the Eucharist a time where communicants are passive recipients rather than active givers. Though communicants are often compelled to live holy lives in response to the grace of the Eucharist, being passive recipients hinders them from sharing it with the world through faith in action. Therefore, the faulty sacramentality ultimately makes the Reformed pastorate less effective in fostering faith in action.

In response to the aforesaid issue the researcher proposed that, apart from a proper understanding of Calvin's pastoral vision and sacramental views, the solution should entail the vision and views of Ulrich Zwingli. Also, instead of rethinking the Reformed tradition's dominant Calvinistic template of pastoral ministry, the researcher proposed that the solution entail the formulation of an alternative template. Through making use of Zwingli's pastoral vision, sacramental views and philosophy of ministry, the researcher worked to create a Zwinglian template for the Reformed pastorate. This new template was designed to complement the Calvinistic template, and aid Reformed ministers in helping parishioners to share the grace of the Eucharist through faith in action.

Understanding Zwingli's Perspective of Faith in Action

To formulate a Zwinglian template that fosters faith in action, the researcher needed to first understand Zwingli's perspective regarding the subject. As shown, the Reformer defined faith in action as the imitation of Christ. In Zwingli's definition Christ serves as the ultimate example of faith in action, and like a soldier responding to his or her captain, the Christian identifies with Him by following His example. Furthermore, the Reformer's definition makes the imitation of Christ more than an "aping" of His actions recorded in Scripture. Instead following the example of Jesus is an act of obedience and thanksgiving unto God for one's salvation, and the sign of His work of election through grace.

Since Zwingli used the illustration of a Captain and soldiers for Christians imitating Christ, then he viewed the process of faith in action as one that trickles down from Christ to the church. Between Christ and the church are pastors, who guide parishioners in the process of putting faith into action. Pastors actively imitate Christ through various means of ministry and personal lives of holiness, which parishioners respond to by following their example. But in imitating pastors, parishioners are not simply imitating people; instead they are following the example of Jesus through designated guides.

Though the Reformer's military illustration of the process of faith in action can appear to be a "mechanical hierarchy," he makes it an organic process through the pastoral relationship. In this relationship Christ the Good Shepherd appoints pastors as "assistant shepherds" to help in leading His church. But unlike a typical flock that simply

follows, the church is taught to imitate the Good Shepherd. In other words, Zwingli's view of faith in action is one where pastors teach sheep how to shepherd. Pastors guide parishioners in the process of faith in action that they might ultimately be able to guide others in the same process.

Significance of Zwingli's Perspective of Faith in Action

Though Calvin stressed the importance of faith being lived out, he differed from Zwingli in his strong emphasis on the personal dimension of faith in action. For the Geneva Reformer, faith in action was a matter of personal holiness where individual believers responded to God's grace by imitating Christ and obeying His commands.¹ In the context of the Eucharist, Calvin's perspective of faith in action focuses on the communicant as recipient and how grace strengthens them in personal piety. Also, Calvin's perspective led him to see Eucharistic grace as something that could not be shared with those outside of Christ. In the *Institutes* he writes that the integrity of the sacrament lies in the fact that non-Christians repel the grace of God and prevent it from reaching them.² Consequently, for the Geneva Reformer, the grace of the Eucharist is solely reserved for the benefit of believers.

In light of Calvin's perspective of Eucharistic grace, the researcher concluded that the thesis problem did not only center on a misunderstanding of the Reformer's pastoral vision, but his strong emphasis on the personal dimension of faith in action. The researcher also concluded that due to the Reformer's emphasis, the Calvinistic template

¹ Carolyn Nystrom, *John Calvin: Sovereign Hope*, 74

² John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion: Vol 2*, 564-565

could lead pastors to unintentionally focus on the personal dimension of faith in action while neglecting its communal dimension. Therefore, Calvin's personal perspective is incomplete and needs to be balanced with Zwingli's more communal perspective.

Like Calvin, the Zürich Reformer held that the imitation of Christ is how believers respond to God's grace. Nevertheless, as he shows in his illustration of a Captain and soldiers, Zwingli emphasized the communal dimensions of faith in action. For the Zürich Reformer, the imitation of Christ was a matter of communal holiness, where believers collectively follow the example of Jesus. Also, Zwingli saw grace as not being bound or reserved for the sole benefit of Christians and their personal piety.³ Instead he saw God's unmerited favor as going beyond those in Christ and, in the context of the Eucharist, focused on the communicant as one who is called to take Eucharistic grace beyond the walls of the sanctuary.

In the end, the researcher concluded that Zwingli's perspective covers areas where Calvin's perspective is incomplete, and helps to bring balance between the personal and communal dimensions of faith in action. Furthermore, a template of pastoral ministry based upon Zwingli's perspective would cover the areas where the Calvinistic template is incomplete. A Zwinglian template would aid pastors in encouraging communal Eucharistic piety, where grace is shared with society at large, as they foster personal Eucharistic piety where grace is received.

³ Philip Schaff, *History of the Christian Church: Volume VIII*, 29

Understanding Zwingli's Pastoral Vision

After exploring Zwingli's perspective of faith in action, the researcher had to find his pastoral vision as the second step in formulating a new template. The researcher also had to explore John Calvin's pastoral vision and compare and contrast it with Zwingli's vision. . As for the Zürich Reformer's vision, it is one of "renewal" where the Christian life is a work of healing society by doing God's will on earth. Calvin's vision on the other hand, is one of "pilgrimage" where the Christian life is a perilous journey to the peace and joys of heaven. The root of Zwingli's pastoral vision was his experience as a local theologian looking for shalom/wholeness for his country. The root of Calvin's vision was his experience as an exile theologian looking for shalom/wholeness in a heavenly country.

In regard to the primary role of pastors, Calvin's vision presents it as helping parishioners to endure the perils of life on earth. Along with parishioners, pastors are fellow travelers, who use the Word of God to encourage believers as they move toward their final destination. In addition to its future-orientation and aim of endurance, Calvin's vision gives more focus to the Gospel's broad dimensions, while using the penal substitution atonement theory and its legal language.

As for Zwingli's vision of renewal, it presents the primary role of pastors as helping parishioners to become agents of healing on earth. For Zwingli pastors are spiritual physicians who use the Word of God to compel Christians in renewing the society. In addition to its present-orientation, Zwingli's vision gives more focus to the

parochial dimensions of the Gospel, while making use of the healing theory of atonement and its medical language.

Significance of Zwingli's Pastoral Vision

While seeking to understand Calvin's vision of pilgrimage, the researcher found that the Reformer's philosophy of ministry is what J. Robert Clinton calls the "harvest leader".⁴ Harvest leaders are people who base their ministries on Christ's teachings regarding the spread of the Kingdom of God. According to Clinton, a harvest leader looks to the "outward thrust" of the Great Commission, which is concerned with adding new members to the church. As a harvest leader, Calvin had a strong passion for missions and equipping parishioners to advance the Kingdom of God by bringing the Gospel far beyond their Genevan context (e.g., the 1555 mission to Brazil).⁵

Along with his experience as an exile theologian, Calvin's vision of pilgrimage is rooted in his philosophy of ministry. Therefore his vision is concerned with the outward thrust of the Great Commission, and inviting others to join the pilgrimage to heaven. But due to its strong future-orientation, the Reformer's vision can be wrongly seen as making the future heavenly life of believers more important than their present earthly life. Furthermore, due to its strong focus on the Gospel's broad dimensions, Calvin's vision could be misunderstood as downplaying the need to address its parochial dimensions (e.g., social justice).

⁴ Clinton, 66-68

⁵ Micheal A.G. Haykin & C. Jeffrey Robinson Sr., *To the Ends of the Earth: Calvin's Missional Vision and Legacy*, 14-16

In light of all that Calvin's vision entails, the researcher concluded that to solve the thesis problem it needed to be balanced with Zwingli's vision of renewal, which is present-oriented and focuses on the Gospel's parochial dimensions. According to Clinton's list of ministry models, Zwingli's philosophy of ministry is the "Shepherd Leader," where ministry is based on Christ's pastoral metaphors and the "inward thrust" of the Great Commission.⁶ In looking to the inward thrust, Zwingli was primarily concerned with the growth of believers in knowing God's will and impacting their context through living it out collectively. As a Shepherd Leader, he had a strong passion for bringing the Gospel to his people, and helping them to understand how they could employ it for the transformation of society.

By complementing Calvin's vision, Zwingli's vision helps to bring balance between the inward and outward thrusts of the Great Commission and the broad and parochial dimensions of the Gospel. But in addition to these things, it also brings balance between the legal and medical aspects of salvation through its healing theory of atonement. Though the penal substitution theory and legal language of Calvin's vision is biblical, it is only part of the fuller picture of the atonement. Left to itself, Calvin's vision can be wrongly seen as promoting a judgmental dismissal of the world and reversing its ills for the pursuit of heaven. Thus Zwingli's vision of renewal, with its healing theory and medical language, is needed to give a more complete picture of the atonement and its implications for humanity.

⁶ Clinton, 63-65

In the end, the researcher concluded that along with their perspectives of faith in action, Calvin and Zwingli's pastoral visions are incomplete by themselves. The researcher also concluded that a Zwinglian template must not complement the Calvinistic template by simply fostering faith in action in the present. The new template must also complement its counterpart by fostering faith in action for the sake of the believer's final destination.

Understanding Zwingli's Sacramentality

For the third step in formulating a Zwinglian template, the researcher needed to understand Zwingli's sacramentality, and specifically in regard to the Eucharist. Due to conflicting opinions among respected scholars, the researcher found it difficult to conduct an independent study of the Reformer's sacramental views. Therefore the researcher decided to interview four relevant people who have worked and are working within the Reformed Church of Zürich. Those interviewed were knowledgeable of Zwingli's Eucharistic views, and helped the researcher in understanding how they relate to those of Calvin and other Reformers.

Because Zwingli was a pioneer his theology was constantly shifting from changes in his context, and this led to significant shifts in his sacramentality. At first he deemed the sacraments as nothing more than acts of obedience [ordinances], but when this made infant baptism unnecessary he rethought his views. Later on the Reformer came to see the sacraments as moments where grace is given through the words of Jesus spoken over the elements. But due to his later views being written in German, they were not as widely circulated as his earlier views which were written in Latin. Thus there are conflicting

opinions regarding the Reformer's sacramentality, and furthermore there are churches that hold to his earlier views (e.g., Mennonite, Baptist and Pentecostal), with little to no knowledge or consideration of his later views.

Unlike Calvin's sacramentality, where Eucharistic grace is solely given for the benefit of Christian society (to strengthen believers for the journey to heaven), Zwingli's sacramentality presents this grace as also being given for the benefit of society in general. In other words, Calvin's sacramentality is concave and focuses on how grace is received, while Zwingli's sacramentality is convex and focuses on how grace is shared. For the Zürich Reformer, sacramental grace is shared when believers put faith into action through the imitation of Christ.

Significance of Zwingli's Sacramentality

Since Calvin's concave sacramentality restricts Eucharistic grace to believers, then a misunderstanding of his pastoral vision is not the sole issue behind the thesis problem. In truth, the Reformer's sacramental views (rooted in his pastoral vision) are not meant to compel parishioners to share Eucharistic grace. Instead, as the researcher learned while conducting interviews, Calvin's sacramentality is meant to prepare believers to rightly receive grace, exhort them to personal holiness and unite them to Christ. Calvin's sacramentality is also aimed at uniting believers in brotherly love, and reconciling the Eucharistic views of Luther and Zwingli.⁷

In summary, Calvin's sacramentality does not aim at making communicants active givers who share Eucharistic grace through faith in action. Furthermore it does not

⁷ John Calvin, *Writings on Pastoral Piety*, 104-110

produce passive recipients who receive grace with no regard for its implications. Instead Calvin's sacramentality compels communicants to be what the researcher calls "active recipients" who in receiving grace are united to Christ, fellowship with one another in brotherly love and are strengthened for holy living as they face the perilous journey to heaven.

Because Calvin's concave sacramentality does not entail the sharing of Eucharistic grace, the researcher concludes that the convex sacramentality of Zwingli's later Eucharistic views is the solution to the thesis problem. Unlike his contemporary, the Zürich Reformer had a more open view of grace that allowed the blessings of the Eucharist to go beyond God's people. The blessings of the Eucharist are the presence of Christ, God's forgiveness and love and a foretaste of the world to come. Through living out these blessings communicants share Eucharistic grace, and in Zwingli's sacramentality this is done by putting faith into action through the imitation of Christ.

Upon consuming the elements with faith in the Gospel, and receiving grace through the words of Jesus, communicants are moved by His real spiritual presence to follow His example in and beyond the church. By imitating Christ, communicants bring His presence to society where they forgive as He forgave, love as He loved and give a glimpse of His Kingdom that is to come. But apart from bringing the presence of Christ, the sharing of Eucharistic grace through faith in action is an act of renewal that brings about healing and shalom amidst the brokenness of the world.

Nevertheless, as Calvin's sacramentality rightly shows, not all the blessings of Eucharistic grace are meant to be shared. In truth, union with Christ, the brotherly love of

Christian fellowship and strength for personal holiness are strictly for those in Christ. Also, as the researcher learned while conducting interviews, Calvin's sacramentality shows that Eucharistic grace is not simply about "doing," but also "being." Therefore, in employing Zwingli's convex sacramental views that foster faith in action, the researcher concludes that it must be balanced with Calvin's concave views that foster fellowship. In the end, though the Zürich Reformer's sacramentality solves the thesis problem, it is incomplete without the sacramentality of his contemporary.

The Healing Shepherd Template

In Christian ministry a "pastoral template" is a transferable pattern of ministry that serves as a blueprint or continuing norm for pastors to emulate. This template is mainly based on the pastoral vision and philosophy of ministry that emerges from the life experiences and work of a specific pastor or group of pastors. In the case of the Calvinistic template, which the researcher calls the "Harvest Shepherd," it is based upon the pilgrimage vision and harvest leader philosophy of John Calvin. This future-oriented template is characterized by a legal view of atonement and helping parishioners to endure the journey to heaven through personal holiness. Within the context of the Eucharist, the Calvinistic template leads pastors to see their role as gathering communicants to receive a grace reserved for the Church and a glimpse of the world to come. Also, the Calvinistic template leads pastors to see themselves as "watchdogs" whose main role is keeping the fold of Christ the Good Shepherd following Him to its final destination.

After gaining a sufficient understanding of Zwingli's pastoral vision of renewal and shepherd leader philosophy of ministry, the researcher formulated a prototype

template called the “Healing Shepherd.” Unlike the Harvest Shepherd, this Zwinglian template is characterized by a medical view of atonement and helping parishioners to become agents of healing through communal holiness. Within the context of the Eucharist, the Healing Shepherd leads pastors to see their role as sending communicants beyond the sanctuary to bring shalom through the sharing of grace. Also, this Zwinglian template leads pastors to see themselves as “assistant shepherds” appointed by Christ the Good Shepherd. As assistant shepherds, pastors are called to put faith into action through the imitation of Christ that His people might do the same and share the blessings of the Eucharist with the world. In summary, the Healing Shepherd helps the fold of Christ to become assistant shepherds who guide others in putting faith into action through following His example.

Testing the New Template

Upon formulating the Healing Shepherd template, the researcher presented it to Balke and Opitz who offered critiques concerning how it complemented the Calvinistic template. The pastor-theologians also pointed out possible points of tension between the Healing Shepherd and its Calvinistic counterpart, and offered the researcher guidance in addressing them. After speaking with Balke and Opitz, the researcher presented the Zwinglian template to Davis and Dippenaar who helped in finding practical ways of testing it in a church context. Because the thesis problem was a sacramental issue, the pastor and ordinand suggested that the Zwinglian template be tested in the areas of Christian Education and liturgy.

In following the advice of Davis and Dippenaar, the researcher first tested the Zwinglian template in the Christian Education Ministry [CEM] of IPC Zürich. Since IPC Zürich follows Calvin's sacramentality, the initial step in testing the new template was seeing the general understanding of the Eucharist among parishioners. To get an adequate picture of this understanding, the researcher worked with two of IPC's Elders who had previously taken part in conducting congregational surveys. After helping the researcher gauge the congregation's general understanding of the Eucharist, the Elders suggested that the new template be tested through the CEM's children's program. This program has the most volunteers, and has a more open atmosphere for the implementation of new ideas.

Through the CEM's children's program, the researcher tested the new template by creating an educational guide titled, *This is My Body: Helping Children Understand the Lord's Supper*. While presenting IPC's Calvinistic sacramentality, the guide acted as a means of presenting Zwingli's sacramentality and its call for communicants to be active givers who follow the example of Jesus in the world. Unlike similar children's ministry tools, which only aim at teaching theological concepts, the ultimate goal of the researcher's guide was to enable parents to guide their children in putting faith into action by sharing the blessings of the Eucharist with others. The goal of enabling parents to guide children stemmed from Zwingli's belief that pastors should enable parishioners to guide others in putting faith into action.

After implementing the Zwinglian template through the CEM's children's program, the researcher tested it through IPC's Communion liturgy. Being from the Presbyterian *Book of Common Worship*, IPC's Communion liturgy promotes Calvin's

concave sacramentality which only focuses on the communicant as recipient. During the time of invitation to the Lord's Table IPC's pastors say, "These are the gifts of God, for you the people of God. Let us keep the feast!," and this reflects Calvin's belief that Eucharistic grace is reserved for believers. Also, many within the IPC community are from church traditions that adhere to Zwingli's early sacramentality where no grace is given and Christ is simply remembered.

To implement the Zwinglian template by way of IPC's communion liturgy, the researcher first identified the Zwinglian influences in the service (e.g., the use of a table instead of an altar). The researcher also drafted new practices for the liturgy that focus on communicants as givers who are called to share the blessings of Eucharistic grace. One such new practice was taking the broken bread before the Words of Invitation and telling the congregation that one half represents the blessings that they receive and the other half represents the blessings they are called to give:

The minister takes one half of the broken bread in each hand and says: In the breaking of His body, Christ received our brokenness and gave us the blessings of God. Therefore the bread we break in memory of Him represents receiving and giving. (Lifting up one half of the loaf) In Christ we receive the blessings of love, forgiveness and the hope of His Kingdom. (Lifting up the other half of the loaf) And in Christ we are called to give these blessings as He gave them long ago and gives them to us now.....Behold the gifts of God for you the people of God. Let us keep the feast!

Unbeknown to the researcher, Dippenaar made use of the aforementioned liturgical practice at a daily lunchtime Communion service that she helps to lead in the Helferei Grossmünster. This service is attended by seminarians, active and retired pastors and theology professors who wish to celebrate Communion more often than it is celebrated in local Reformed churches. Upon showing the researcher's alternative

meaning for the broken bread, Dippenaar found that it greatly encouraged the congregation. One active pastor that was present stated that this alternative meaning made her see the Eucharist and her role as the celebrant with fresh eyes.

After testing the Healing Shepherd template through IPC's CEM and liturgy, the researcher found that it was capable of helping foster faith in action. The Healing Shepherd template led to the creation of teaching tools and practices for worship that allowed parishioners to see themselves as recipients and givers of grace at the Lord's Table. Moreover, the template led Reformed pastors to see themselves and how they give the Eucharist differently. In the case of the pastor who spoke with Dippenaar, she no longer saw herself as only gathering parishioners to receive grace from Christ, but also sending them out to share grace with the world through doing the work of Christ.

Strengths of the New Template

In regard to the strong points of the Healing Shepherd template, the researcher observed four major strengths which are a presentation and practical application of Zwingli's later Eucharistic views, balance rather than conflict with Calvin, the insights of leading Zwingli scholars and the use of Zwinglian sources in their original languages. Apropos of the first strength, this project presents Zwingli's later Eucharistic views, which are generally unknown in churches outside of Switzerland. Much of what is known about Zwingli's sacramentality comes from his earlier views, which have become the standard position of many non-sacramental church traditions. This project also presents practical ways that enable the Reformer's later views to be realized in a congregation's sacramental life.

As for the second strength, the new template promotes balance rather than conflict between views of Zwingli and Calvin. Quite often the perspectives of both Reformers are presented as being opposed to each other, but as the researcher has shown this is not the case. Though Calvin and Zwingli would disagree on many points (e.g., original guilt, theories of atonement, open vs. closed grace etc.), their views complement one another. Consequently, one Reformer's perspective is incomplete without the other and works with its counterpart to give a fuller picture of the Reformed pastorate. Zwingli and Calvin are like two sides of a coin, and when one side is missing the coin lacks its full value.

The third strength, which is the insights of leading Zwingli scholars, makes it so that the template formulated by the researcher is credible and based upon a proper understanding of the Reformer's thought. Furthermore, the insights of leading scholars make it so that the template has been formulated with the guidance of credible voices within the Reformed world. Under the guidance of Balke and Opitz, the researcher's conclusions were properly critiqued, and the researcher was given a great amount of helpful assistance in making revisions. The researcher also received a greater amount of understanding regarding Calvin's pastoral vision and sacramentality. In addition to being leading Zwingli scholars, Balke and Opitz are leading scholars in Calvin studies and were well aware of the thesis problem. In fact, they are currently taking part in a series of research projects that aim at better understanding Zwingli's sacramentality and applying it in Reformed Churches outside of Switzerland.

In regard to the fourth and final strength of this project, the researcher read Zwingli's writings in their original languages (Latin and old Alemannic German) in the process of formulating the new template. While collecting sources, the researcher discovered that many modern works about the Reformer are based upon information gathered from poor translations of his writings and/or secondary sources. By reading Zwingli's works in their original languages, the researcher was better able to understand the Reformer's thought, and to better judge the conclusions of secondary sources. The researcher was also able to gain access to a wider range of sources (e.g., records from the Zürich city archives) while collecting data to better understand Zwingli's life and context.

Weaknesses of the New Template

In regard to the weak points of the Healing Shepherd template, the researcher observed four major weaknesses which are oversimplifying the Calvinistic template, tension between views of grace, reducing Reformed pastoral thought to two thinkers and a need for further testing and follow up. On the subject of the first weakness, the Zwinglian template of the researcher can appear to oversimplify its counterpart. Though the Calvinistic template places a strong emphasis on the final destination of believers, it is not fully future-oriented. In truth, Calvin called the Church to transform society in the present through personal holiness; therefore the Calvinistic template has a partial present-orientation. Also the new template can wrongly depict Zwingli's pastoral vision as only being present-oriented, when there are instances where he writes about heaven. In response to this weakness the researcher acknowledges that both templates are neither fully present nor future-oriented. Instead each template reflects the theme of its

Reformer's vision (pilgrimage and renewal), which emphasize one period of time over the other.

As for the second weakness, the new template brings about a tension between Zwingli and Calvin's views of grace. Though both Reformers believed that grace is God's unmerited favor, they disagreed on whether or not Eucharistic grace was restricted to believers only. In response to the tension between Zwingli's open perspective and Calvin's closed perspective, the researcher suggests that both views be likened to the "already/not yet" principle of Kingdom theology. In this principle, believers are seen as simultaneously being in the Kingdom of God and waiting for the Kingdom to come. By applying this principle to Zwingli and Calvin's open and closed views, the researcher believes that they become a simultaneous reality where Eucharistic grace is "restricted/unrestricted."

The third weakness, which is reducing Reformed pastoral thought to two thinkers, makes it so that the new template seems to give a "Zwingli and Calvin only" message. Nevertheless, the researcher did not intend to give such a message, and is aware of the important contributions of other Reformed thinkers. In only engaging the views of Zwingli and Calvin, the researcher was looking to the main roots of Reformed pastoral theology. Just as the Zürich and Geneva traditions of Zwingli and Calvin are the foundation of the Reformed tradition, their pastoral traditions are the foundation of Reformed pastoral theology. All other Reformed thinkers, such as Heinrich Bullinger and Theodore Beza, emerge from and build upon the pastoral traditions of Zwingli and Calvin.

In regard to the fourth and final weakness of the Healing Shepherd template, the researcher first sees the need for more testing. Though implementing the new template within IPC Zürich brought positive results, these results could be attributed to the unique dynamics of the congregation's Swiss-German context. Therefore the template needs to be tested in contexts outside of Switzerland, and furthermore contexts with no national Church. In addition to the need for more testing, the researcher also sees the need for further follow up with the new template. Though the template presents a sacramentality that leads communicants to see themselves as givers, it does not ensure that they will be mindful of the blessings they are called to share and (through daily imitating Christ) put faith into action throughout the week.

CHAPTER SEVEN: REFLECTION

Personal Insights

After hearing that Ulrich Zwingli was my least favorite theologian, David Stenner of All Saints' Reistertown offered me an interesting challenge. As I shared my disdain for the Swiss Reformer, Rev. Stenner replied, "Here's a topic for your thesis. Why not write about Zwingli? His theology is rarely used, and you might be surprised at what you learn." Three years later, as I finish my doctoral thesis, I find myself spellbound by the deep richness of a theologian I have come to love.

While exploring literature for this project, I initially treated Zwingli's works as mere academic texts and research tools. But as I looked closer at his writings, I realized that they were filled with wisdom that could deepen my spiritual life and faith. I also realized that Zwingli's writings could enrich my pastoral life and ministry, and nothing enriched these things more than his sermons, *Der Hirt (The Shepherd)* and *Von Klarheit und Gewissheit des Wortes Gottes (The Clarity and Certainty of the Word of God)*. Before reading these sermons I was confused regarding my identity as a pastor and how I should preach. Sadly, there were many negative voices within my parish who encouraged me to be more of an administrative pastor and preach with less Bible exposition and more "life applications."

Along with confusion regarding my pastoral identity and preaching, I also faced discouragement from positive voices that questioned my doctoral work. On numerous occasions well-meaning Christians would encourage me to be less "academic" and ask how my doctoral thesis would "meet the daily needs of those in the pews." Nevertheless in the face of numerous voices, the two aforesaid sermons of Zwingli provided words of comfort and encouragement. As I read *Der Hirt* to understand the Reformer's perspective of faith in action, he helped me to see that my primary identity as a pastor was that of a

shepherd, who leads Christ's flock with the Holy Scriptures. The Reformer also helped me to see that being a shepherd is about helping parishioners to find healing in the Gospel, and encourage them to be vessels of healing through following the example of Christ their Captain.

After learning that my primary identity as a pastor was to be a "healing shepherd," I then came to see how I should preach. As I sought to understand Zwingli's pastoral vision, I read *Von Klarheit und Gewissheit des Wortes Gottes*, where he states that a true understanding of the Holy Scriptures is accessible to all those in Christ. In others words, the Reformer showed me that preaching is first and foremost trusting in the Holy Spirit to give the listener understanding. Also, while collecting data at the *International Congress on Calvin Research*, I observed that Zwingli's shepherd imagery likens preaching to bringing sheep to grazing grounds. During the sermon, the pastor leads the flock of Christ to the field of Holy Scripture, and lets them feast upon the Word of God. Furthermore, as parishioners feast on God's Word the pastor must avoid feeding them their word, which often comes in the form of well-intentioned life applications.

From the comfort and encouragement of Zwingli's sermons, I found myself secure in my pastoral identity and preaching style. In all honesty, I had heard similar sermons before, but the way in which the Reformer presented his ideas made me look upon the subjects of pastoral identity and preaching with a renewed zeal. But apart from these things, Zwingli led me to look upon the Eucharist with a renewed interest, and especially when it came to the real spiritual presence of Christ. As I went about conducting research on Zwingli's sacramentality, I first assumed that it was a graceless

memorialism for the sole purpose of expressing individual faith. Growing up in the Baptist tradition I knew the memorialist view well, and it was this understanding of the Eucharist that led me to look upon the Reformer with disdain. After all, in my opinion, he had made the Eucharist into something like a funeral luncheon, where parishioners ate and drank to the memory of Jesus.

In spite of my initial assumptions, studying relevant literature and conducting interviews opened my eyes to another way of viewing the Eucharist that left me in awe. Being a Presbyterian minister I was very knowledgeable of Calvin's sacramentality, but for years I had longed for a sacramentality that entailed more than Christ embracing His people and blessing them. In Zwingli's Eucharistic views I found what I had longed for, for in this sacramentality the people of Christ are sent out to embrace the world and share His blessings. Also, while exploring Zwingli's sacramentality, I learned that it had always been present in my faith journey and ministry. Little did I know that the Reformer initiated the practice of using a table, and having the people gathering around it to receive the bread and cup. Despite feeling like a funeral luncheon, it was these liturgical practices that sparked my love of and early questions about the Eucharist.

In the end, my studies of Zwingli's sacramentality revealed that his influence had silently been in my life since my childhood years, and in becoming more aware of it my life, faith and ministry were deeply enriched. And as I reflected upon the impact of the Reformer's influence, I was thankful for having accepted Rev. Stenner's challenge and longed for others to be surprised by Zwingli as I had.

Suggestions for Further Research

If I could do this project over again, I would go about further study in four main areas. These areas are Zwingli's influence on Calvin, how other Reformers of the Zürich tradition have developed Zwingli's sacramentality, shifts in Zwingli's theology and more interviews with relevant voices in Zwingli studies. In regard to the first area of study, I found myself unable to do a more exhaustive study of Zwingli's influence on his young contemporary. When I began conducting research for this project the study of Calvin's influences was beginning to develop, and by the time a sufficient amount of data was collected on the subject my project was near completion. If I had done further study in this area, I would have a better sense of the overlap between Calvin and Zwingli's pastoral visions and sacramental views.

As for the second area of further study, I found myself unable to fully explore how Zwingli's sacramentality has been developed by subsequent Reformers of the Zürich tradition. My greatest regret with not going deeper in this area was that I missed out on possible insights that could have strengthened my arguments and aided in formulating a Zwinglian template. I also was worried that I might have "reinvented the wheel" in regard to my conclusions and solution to the thesis problem. Nevertheless, I did read the works of Heinrich Bullinger and Bromiley's assessment of how he further developed Zwingli's perspective of the Eucharist. I also discussed my regrets and disappointments with Opitz who assured me that, to his knowledge, no later Reformer of the Zürich tradition had drawn the conclusions that I had. Opitz also stated that the recent resurgence of research regarding Zwingli's contemporaries, save Bullinger, further developing his ideas is still in its early stages.

The third area of further study was shifts in Zwingli's theology, which I had to limit to the shift within his sacramentality. According to Balke and Dippenaar, researching the shifts in Zwingli's theology would be a topic for another dissertation. But more study in this area would have given me a clearer picture of which views of the Reformer remained in operation in his later perspective. In all honesty, I was most disappointed by my inability to go deeper in this area because it pertains to the very thing that attracts me to Zwingli's perspective. Out of all the things I admire about Zwingli's theology, I most admire its unfixed pioneer nature that attempts to be true to Scripture while adjusting to the changing needs and situation of his context. While writing this thesis, I constantly struggled with focusing on the main topic due to the interesting theological shifts I encountered.

For the final area of further study, time constraints, conflicting schedules and traveling outside of Switzerland limited me to four interviews. In regard to traveling, Balke lives in Den Haag, and due to his many speaking engagements I had to divide his interview into three segments, which took place over the course of one week. Though Balke, Opitz, Davis and Dippenaar provided a sufficient amount of information, there were several other individuals in Zürich who could have provided important insights. In an attempt to increase the number of interviews, I initially sent out the questionnaire by e-mail, but other potential interviewees declined due to a lack of availability. Nevertheless, extra interviews could have made research more complicated and overloaded me with too much data to be processed.

In conclusion, further study in these four areas could have benefitted my research greatly, but limitations such as time and writing deadlines hindered me. Along with these

main areas, I also regret not doing further study with more tests of the Healing Shepherd template. With these extra tests I could have obtained more feedback to measure the template's effectiveness, but the same limitations for the other areas of study limited me in doing this. Therefore, I have chosen to be content with and thankful for the positive feedback that has come from IPC Zürich and the Helferei Grossmünster.

Future Use of Current Research

After almost six years of courses, research and writing I will take some time to rest before doing more with the information gleaned from this project. In regard to future use, I plan to further develop liturgical practices that will reflect the Healing Shepherd template and aid Reformed pastors in living it out. I am also considering the possibility of conducting classes or seminars to educate pastors about the need for Zwingli's pastoral vision and sacramentality in Reformed pastoral theology. But above all, I plan on drafting a Eucharistic liturgy where Zwingli's influence is not silent or behind the scenes and is balanced with that of Calvin. This new liturgy will reflect the Zürich Reformer's later sacramental views, and compel communicants to be active givers as they actively receive Eucharistic grace. As communicants receive the blessings of the Eucharist, this new liturgy will compel them to put faith in action through the imitation of Christ, and in so doing, share His marvelous blessings and healing grace.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Akin, Daniel. *A Theology for the Church*. Nashville, TN: B and H Academic, 2007.

- Backus, Irena. *The Reception of the Church Fathers in the West - from the Carolingians to the Maurists: Volume 1*. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill Academic Publishers, 1997.
- Barth, Karl. *The Theology of John Calvin*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1995.
- Bailey, Sarah "Q&A: Marilynne Robinson on Guns, Gay Marriage and Calvinism." Religion News (blog). <http://www.religionnews.com/2014/05/09/qa-marilynne-robinson-guns-gay-marriage-calvinism/>, May 9, 2014. Accessed May 9, 2014.
- Beilby, James and Paul R. Eddy, *The Nature of the Atonement*. Downer's Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2006.
- Beisner, E. Calvin. *The Auburn Avenue Theology, Pros and Cons: Debating the Federal Vision*. Ft. Lauderdale, FL: Knox Theological Seminary, 2004.
- Bell, Rob. *Love Wins*. New York, NY: HarperOne, 2012.
- BlackWelll, William. *Ulrich Zwingli: The Patriotic Reformer*. Vestavia Hilly, AL: Solid Ground Christian Books, 2013.
- Bromiley, Geoffrey. *Zwingli and Bullinger*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1953.
- Büsser, Fritz. "The Shepherd – Who Is the True Pastor?" *Christian History*, 3 (1): 16-19.
- Cairns Earle. *Christianity Through the Centuries: A History of the Christian Church*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1996.
- Calvin, John. *An Abridgement of the Institution of the Christian Religion*. Charleston, SC: Nabu Press, 2011.
- _____. *Institutes of the Christian Religion: Vol. 1*. Philadelphia, PA: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1813.
- _____. *Institutes of the Christian Religion: Vol 2*. Philadelphia, PA: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1813.
- _____. *John Calvin: Writings on Pastoral Piety*. Mahwah, NY: Paulist Press, 2002.
- Catherwood, Christopher. *Five Leading Reformers*. Scotland, United Kingdom: Christian Focus Publications, 2000.
- Clinton, J. Robert. *Leadership Emergence Theory: A Self-Study Manual for Analyzing the Development of a Christian Leader*. Madison, WI: Printing Plus, 1989.
- Cole, Allan H. *From Midterms to Ministry: Practical Theologians on Pastoral Beginnings*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2008.

- Creswell, J.W. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2013.
- Curtis, Kenneth. "Reformation Overview". Documentary, Christian History Institute, Worcester, PA, July 17, 2012.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BSmYchmMCOc>.
- D'Aubigné, Jean. *For God and His People*. Greenville, SC: BJU Press, 2004.
- Davis, Richard. *How Zurich Changed The World*. Zürich, CH: IPC Publications, 2007.
- De Hoyos, Maria and Sally-Anne Barnes. "Analyzing Interview Data." Lecture, Core Training Modules, Warwick, February 15, 2012.
- Derville-Gallicano Tiffany. "An Example on How to Perform Open Coding, Axial Coding and Selective Coding." *The PR Post*, July 22, 2013, <http://prpost.wordpress.com/2013/07/22/an-example-of-how-to-perform-open-coding-axial-coding-and-selective-coding/> (accessed November 19, 2014).
- Erasmus, Desiderius. *In Praise of Folly*. Mineola NY: Dover Publications, 2003.
- Estrep, James, Michael Anthony, and Gregg Allison. *A Theology for Christian Education*. Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2008.
- Evans, G.R. *The History of Pastoral Care*. London, United Kingdom: Bloomsbury Academic, 2000.
- Held-Evans, Rachel. "Why Calvinism Makes Me Cry." *Rachel Held Evans* (blog), September 14, 2009. Accessed October 29, 2014. <http://rachelheldevans.com/blog/calvinismmakesmecry>.
- Forbes, James A. "The Healing Hands of My Father." Sermon, The Riverside Church, New York, NY, June 19, 2014. Accessed October 14, 2014. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y6JtO5tW4-o>.
- Fosdick, Harry. *Great Voices of the Reformation*. New York, NY: Random House Inc., 1952.
- Gaventa, Beverly R. and Robert B. Hays. *Seeking the Identity of Jesus: A Pilgrimage*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2008.
- Gäbler Ulrich. *Huldrych Zwingli: His Life and Work*. Philadelphia, PA: Fortress Press, 1986.
- George, Victor. *Major Thinkers in Welfare: Contemporary Issues in Historical Perspective*. Bristol, United Kingdom: Policy Press, 2012.

- Glaser, Barney G. and Anselm L. Strauss. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Piscataway, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1999.
- Goff, Jacques. *Medieval Callings*. Chicago, IL: University Of Chicago Press, 1995.
- González, Justo. *The Story of Christianity: Volume 2*. New York, NY; HarperCollins Publishers, 1985.
- Hall, Douglas. *God and Human Suffering*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1987.
- Haykin, Micheal A.G. and C. Jeffrey Robinson Sr. *To the Ends of the Earth: Calvin's Missional Vision and Legacy*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2014.
- Hendrix, Scott. *Early Protestant Spirituality*. Mahwah, NY: Paulist Press, 2009.
- Hinlicky Paul. *Luther and the Beloved Community*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2010.
- Hoekema, Anthony. *The Bible and the Future*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1994.
- Huyser-Honig, Joan. "Lord's Supper Practice in the Reformed and Presbyterian Tradition," worship.calvin.edu. <http://worship.calvin.edu/resources/resource-library/lord-s-supper-practice-in-the-reformed-and-presbyterian-tradition/> accessed December 11, 2014).
- Jackson, Samuel. *Huldreich Zwingli the Reformer of German Switzerland*. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1903.
- _____. *The Selected Works of Huldreich Zwingli*. Philadephia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1901.
- _____. *Ulrich Zwingli: Early Writings*. Eugene, OR; Wipf & Stock Publishers, 2000.
- _____. *Ulrich Zwingli: On Providence and Other Essays*. Durham, NC: Labyrinth Press, 1983.
- James III, Frank, "Calvin the Evangelist," *Reformed Quarterly* 19 (2): <http://rq.rts.edu/fall01/james.html> (accessed October 20, 2014)
- Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti. *An Introduction to the History of Religions*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2003.
- Kinneer, Jack. "A Calvinist Looks at Orthodoxy." opc.org. http://www.opc.org/new_horizons/calvinist_on_orthodoxy.html (accessed October 1, 2014)
- Lindberg, Carter. *The European Reformations*. West Sussex, United Kingdom: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009.

- Locher, Gottfried. *Zwingli's Thought: New Perspectives*. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill Academic Publishers, 1997.
- Maltby, William. *Reformation Europe: A Guide to Research: Volume 3*. St. Louis, MO: Center for Reformation Research, 1992.
- Mandryk, Jason, *Operation World: The Definitive Prayer Guide to Every Nation*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2010.
- Manetsh, Scott M., "Is the Reformation Over? John Calvin, Roman Catholicism and Contemporary Ecumenical Conversations," *Themelios* 36 (2) : 185-202.
- McGrath, Alister. *Christian Theology: An Introduction* West Sussex, United Kingdom: Wiley-Blackwell, 1997.
- McKim, Donald. *Major Themes in the Reformed Tradition*. Eugene, OR; Wipf and Stock Publishers, 1998.
- _____. *The Cambridge Companion to John Calvin*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Muller, Richard. *Calvin and the Reformed Tradition*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2012.
- Nystrom, Carolyn. *John Calvin: Sovereign Hope*, Downers Grove, IL: IVP Connect, 2002.
- Opitz, Peter. "Calvin in the Context of the Swiss Reformation" Lecture, International Congress on Calvin Research from University of Zürich, Zürich, CH, August 24, 2014.
- Parker, T.H.L. *John Calvin: A Biography*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2007.
- PCUSA. *Book of Confessions*. Louisville, KY: The Office of the General Assembly, 1999.
- Pipkin, Wayne H. *Huldrych Zwingli: Selected Writings*. Vol. 2. Pittsburgh, PA: Pickwick Publications, 1984.
- Potter, G.R. *Zwingli*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Rummel, Erika. *The Erasmus Reader*. Toronto, Ontario: University of Toronto Press, 1990.
- Sayers, Dorothy. *Strong Meat*. London, United Kingdom: Hodder and Stoughton, 1939.

- Schaff, Philip. *History of the Christian Church: Volume VIII*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2009.
- _____. *The Creeds of Christendom, With a History and Critical Notes; Volume I*. New York, NY: Harper and Brothers, 1919.
- Schreiner, Susan. *Are You Alone Wise?*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Schreiner, Thomas R. and Matthew R. Crawford. *The Lord's Supper: Remembering and Proclaiming Christ until He Comes*. Nashville, TN: B and H Academic, 2011.
- Sedmak, Clemens. *Doing Local Theology: A Guide for Artisans of a New Humanity*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2003.
- Selderhuis, H. J. *Calvinus Clarrismus Theologus: Papers of the 10th International Congress on Calvin Research*. Göttingen, Germany: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 2012.
- _____. *John Calvin: A Pilgrim's Life*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2009.
- _____. *The Calvin Handbook*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2009.
- Smart, James. *Revolutionary Theology in the Making: Barth-Thurneysen Correspondence 1924-1925*. Richmond, VA: John Knox Press, 1964.
- Smith, Colin. "The Sacramental Theology of the Reformers." [www.colindsmith.com](http://www.colindsmith.com/papers/papers.html). <http://www.colindsmith.com/papers/papers.html> (accessed August 11, 2014).
- Spickard, Paul and K. M. Cragg. *A Global History of Christians: How Everyday Believers Experienced Their World*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2001.
- Spierling, Karen E. *Infant Baptism in Reformation Geneva: The Shaping of a Community*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2005.
- Stadler, Anita G. *Leadership Development by Divine Design: An Exploration of Christian Leadership Emergence Theory in the Corporate Context*. Virginia Beach, VA: Regent University, 2008.
- _____. "Leadership Emergence Theory in the Corporate Context." *International Journal of Leadership Studies* 5, no. 1 (Spring, 2009): 115-122.
- Steinmetz, David. *Calvin in Context*. Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Stevenson, Richard. *John Calvin: The Statesman*. New York, NY: Eaton and Mains, 2011. Kindle edition.

- Storms, Sam. "Zwingli and the Anabaptists." www.samstorms.com/all-articles/post/zwilingli-and-anabaptists (accessed October 16, 2014).
- Strange, Alan. "Understanding the Federal Vision." [www.opc.org.http://www.opc.org/nh.html?article_id=478](http://www.opc.org/nh.html?article_id=478) (accessed October 14, 2014).
- Sutter, Deborah. "Dieser Pfarrer sagt: Gott existiert nicht." *20 Minuten*, April 5, 2013, <http://www.20min.ch/schweiz/news/story/Dieser-Pfarrer-sagt---Gott-existiert-nicht--13867607> (accessed April 13, 2013).
- Thompson, Bard. *Humanist and Reformers: A History of the Renaissance and Reformation*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1996.
- Wallace, Peter. *European History in Perspective: The Long European Reformation*. Basingstoke, United Kingdom; Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Walton, Robert. "The Institutionalization of the Reformation in Zürich." *Zwingliana* 8, no. 2, (Winter, 1972): 497-515.
- Wandel, Lee. "Brothers and Neighbors: The Language of Community in Zwingli's Preaching." *Zwingliana* 17, no. 5, (Spring, 1988): 361-374.
- Wax, Trevin. "Theron's Story: Why I Left Evangelicalism for Eastern Orthodoxy." *The Gospel Coalition* (blog), November 8, 2006. Accessed October 1, 2014. <http://www.thegospelcoalition.org/blogs/trevinwax/2006/11/08/therons-story-why-i-left-evangelicalism-for-eastern-orthodoxy/>
- Wiersbe, Warren. *Treasury of the World's Greatest Sermons*. Grand Rapids, MI: Kregel Academic and Professional, 1993.
- Williams, Carrie. "Research Methods." *Journal of Business and Economic Research*, 5 no. 3 (March 2007): 65-72.
- Wright, Shawn. "John Calvin as Pastor," *Southern Baptist Journal of Theology* 13, no. 4 (Winter, 2009): 4-17.
- Zachmann, Randall. *John Calvin and Roman Catholicism*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2008.
- Zwingli, Ulrich. *Commentary on True and False Religion*. Durham, NC: Labyrinth, 1981.